

City of Franklin, Tennessee

**Tabulation of Bids\***

Purchasing Office Solicitation No.:	2011-017 (1 color copier for the Administration Department)
	2011-018A (1 color copier for the MIT Department)
	2011-018B (1 color copier for the Finance Department)
	2011-019 (1 color copier for Fleet Maintenance)
	2011-020 (1 color copier for the Water Management Department headquarters)
	2011-021 (1 color copier for the Water Reclamation Facility)
Notice to Bidders published in the <i>Williamson Herald</i> on:	2/10/11
Number of vendors that were notified of / that responded to this solicitation for bids:	12 / 3
Date and time bids due and publicly opened:	2/24/11 2:00 PM
Present at opening of bids:	Jeff Wenger of Konica Minolta, Bryan Young of DBM and Daniel Sheppard of NovaCopy, Mark Hilty of the City of Franklin Water Management Department; and Tiffany Wilkins and Brian Wilcox of the City of Franklin Purchasing Office
Target meeting of BOMA at which recommendation will be considered:	3/22/11

Bids received from:	Solicitation No.:	Make & Model:	Does the bid item MOES <sup>1</sup> ? / If not, how many exceptions do not MOES <sup>1</sup> ?	Fee for purchases (credit for trade-in values):	Estimated fees for maintenance services for 60 mos.:	Payment terms:	Estimated time of delivery after receipt of order:	Bid is valid through:
Digital Business Machines 5217 Linbar Dr., Suite 306 Nashville, TN 37211 Bryan Young, Sales Representative 615/370-4211	2011-017	Toshiba 3530	Bidder takes no exceptions; however, City does not find required references	\$7,219.80	\$6,966.00	net 30 days	7 days	11/24/2012
	2011-018A	Toshiba 3530		\$7,219.80	\$11,292.00		7 days	
	2011-018B	Toshiba 6530		\$12,546.45	\$10,080.00		7 days	
	2011-019	Toshiba 3530		\$6,073.20	\$6,966.00		7 days	
	2011-020	Toshiba 4520		\$8,237.25	\$17,616.00		7 days	
	2011-021	Toshiba 2330		\$6,073.20	\$3,318.00		7 days	
	Trade-Ins:	Sharp AR-BC320 (ID4467)	(\$280.00)	n/a		n/a		
		Sharp AR-BC320 (ID4466)	(\$280.00)					
		Minolta Di550 (ID11030)	(\$155.00)					
		Minolta Di550 (ID11060)	(\$155.00)					
	Sharp AR-BC320 (ID4465)	(\$280.00)						
	Minolta Di250 (ID10118)	(\$120.00)						
<b>Total (sum of purchases less trade-ins plus estimated maintenance services):</b>				<b>\$102,337.70</b>				

<sup>1</sup>MOES indicates "meet(s) or exceed(s) specifications"

\*Highlighted bid is apparent lowest best bid

**Tabulation of Bids\***

Purchasing Office Solicitation No.:	2011-017 (1 color copier for the Administration Department)
	2011-018A (1 color copier for the MIT Department)
	2011-018B (1 color copier for the Finance Department)
	2011-019 (1 color copier for Fleet Maintenance)
	2011-020 (1 color copier for the Water Management Department headquarters)
	2011-021 (1 color copier for the Water Reclamation Facility)
Notice to Bidders published in the <i>Williamson Herald</i> on:	2/10/11
Number of vendors that were notified of / that responded to this solicitation for bids:	12 / 3
Date and time bids due and publicly opened:	2/24/11 2:00 PM
Present at opening of bids:	Jeff Wenger of Konica Minolta, Bryan Young of DBM and Daniel Sheppard of NovaCopy, Mark Hilty of the City of Franklin Water Management Department; and Tiffany Wilkins and Brian Wilcox of the City of Franklin Purchasing Office
Target meeting of BOMA at which recommendation will be considered:	3/22/11

Bids received from:	Solicitation No.:	Make & Model:	Does the bid item MOES <sup>1</sup> ? / If not, how many exceptions do not MOES <sup>1</sup> ?	Fee for purchases (credit for trade-in values):	Estimated fees for maintenance services for 60 mos.:	Payment terms:	Estimated time of delivery after receipt of order:	Bid is valid through:
Konica Minlta Business Solutions USA, Inc. 1655-B Murfreesboro Rd. Nashville, TN 37217 Jeffrey Wenger, Named Account Exec. 615/238-2144	2011-017	KMBS C360	Bidder takes no exceptions; however, City does not find required information for minimum number of references	\$7,900.00	\$7,020.00	net 30 days	30 days	4/30/2011
	2011-018A	KMBS C360		\$7,900.00	\$12,240.00		30 days	
	2011-018B	KMBS C652		\$12,074.00	\$14,400.00		30 days	
	2011-019	KMBS C360		\$6,500.00	\$7,020.00		30 days	
	2011-020	KMBS C452		\$8,701.00	\$19,260.00		30 days	
	2011-021	KMBS C220		\$4,099.00	\$2,520.00		30 days	
	Trade-Ins:	Sharp AR-BC320 (ID4467)	\$0.00	n/a		n/a		
		Sharp AR-BC320 (ID4466)	\$0.00					
		Minolta Di550 (ID11030)	\$0.00					
		Minolta Di550 (ID11060)	\$0.00					
	Sharp AR-BC320 (ID4465)	\$0.00						
	Minolta Di250 (ID10118)	\$0.00						
<b>Total (sum of purchases less trade-ins plus estimated maintenance services):</b>				<b>\$109,634.00</b>				

<sup>1</sup>MOES indicates "meet(s) or exceed(s) specifications"

\*Highlighted bid is apparent lowest best bid

**Tabulation of Bids\***

Purchasing Office Solicitation No.:	2011-017 (1 color copier for the Administration Department)
	2011-018A (1 color copier for the MIT Department)
	2011-018B (1 color copier for the Finance Department)
	2011-019 (1 color copier for Fleet Maintenance)
	2011-020 (1 color copier for the Water Management Department headquarters)
	2011-021 (1 color copier for the Water Reclamation Facility)
Notice to Bidders published in the <i>Williamson Herald</i> on:	2/10/11
Number of vendors that were notified of / that responded to this solicitation for bids:	12 / 3
Date and time bids due and publicly opened:	2/24/11 2:00 PM
Present at opening of bids:	Jeff Wenger of Konica Minolta, Bryan Young of DBM and Daniel Sheppard of NovaCopy, Mark Hilty of the City of Franklin Water Management Department; and Tiffany Wilkins and Brian Wilcox of the City of Franklin Purchasing Office
Target meeting of BOMA at which recommendation will be considered:	3/22/11

Bids received from:	Solicitation No.:	Make & Model:	Does the bid item MOES <sup>1</sup> ? / If not, how many exceptions do not MOES <sup>1</sup> ?	Fee for purchases (credit for trade-in values):	Estimated fees for maintenance services for 60 mos.:	Payment terms:	Estimated time of delivery after receipt of order:	Bid is valid through:	
NovaCopy, Inc. 15 Lindsley Ave. Nashville, TN 37210 Daniel Sheppard, Major Account Solutions Speiclaist 615/414-7927	2011-017	KMBS C360		\$6,645.00	\$6,016.50		7 days		
	2011-018A	KMBS C360		\$6,645.00	\$9,738.00		7 days		
	2011-018B	KMBS C652	Bidder takes no exceptions	\$11,547.00	\$9,702.00		7 days		
	2011-019	KMBS C360		\$5,600.00	\$6,016.50		7 days		
	2011-020	KMBS C452		\$8,366.00	\$13,570.20	net 30 days	7 days	12/30/2011	
	2011-021	KMBS C220		\$3,632.00	\$2,816.40		7 days		
			Sharp AR-BC320 (ID4467)		\$0.00				
			Sharp AR-BC320 (ID4466)		\$0.00	n/a			
		Trade-Ins:	Minolta Di550 (ID11030)		\$0.00				
			Minolta Di550 (ID11060)		\$0.00				
		Sharp AR-BC320 (ID4465)		\$0.00			n/a		
		Minolta Di250 (ID10118)		\$0.00					
	<b>Total (sum of purchases less trade-ins plus estimated maintenance services):</b>			<b>\$90,294.60</b>					

<sup>1</sup>MOES indicates "meet(s) or exceed(s) specifications"

\*Highlighted bid is apparent lowest best bid



# MEMORANDUM

February 28, 2011

**TO:** Board of Mayor and Aldermen

**FROM:** Eric S. Stuckey, City Administrator *ES*  
 Russell Truell, Assistant City Administrator / CFO  
 Brian Wilcox, Purchasing Manager

**SUBJECT:** Bid award to NovaCopy, Inc. of Nashville, TN for purchase of six (6) new commercial-grade multifunction copiers for various departments (Purchasing Office Procurement Solicitation No. 2011-017 through 021; not specifically budgeted for in FY2011)

**Purpose**

The purpose of this procurement is:

1. to supply and deliver to and install for the City of Franklin six (6) new commercial-grade multifunction color copiers, one (1) each at the following six (6) locations:

Procurement Solicitation No.	City Office	Location
2011-017	Administration Department mail room	City Hall Suite 103 109 3 <sup>rd</sup> Ave. South Franklin, TN 37064
2011-018A	Municipal Information Technology Department	City Hall Suite 108 109 3 <sup>rd</sup> Ave. South Franklin, TN 37064
2011-018B	Finance Department	City Hall Suite 111 109 3 <sup>rd</sup> Ave. South Franklin, TN 37064
2011-019	Fleet Maintenance office	405 Hillsboro Rd. (a.k.a., 405 5 <sup>th</sup> Ave. N.) Franklin, TN 37064
2011-020	Water Management Headquarters front office	405 Hillsboro Rd. (a.k.a., 405 5 <sup>th</sup> Ave. N.) Franklin, TN 37064
2011-021	Water Reclamation Facility office	135 Claude Yates Dr. Franklin, TN 37064

2. to supply and deliver to the City of Franklin specified ongoing maintenance services for the new commercial-grade multifunction copiers purchased pursuant to this solicitation; and



3. to remove and properly dispose of the following six (6) surplus copiers at the respective locations as listed above:

Procurement Solicitation No.	Make and Model	Date of original installation	Total clicks (as of 2/11/2011)
2011-017	Sharp AR-BC320	4/30/2005	41,786 b&w
			212,135 color
2011-018A	Sharp AR-BC320	4/30/2005	38,311 b&w
			128,537 color
2011-018B	[not applicable; the machine currently assigned to the Finance Department has service life remaining and will be reassigned to another City office]		
2011-019	Minolta Di550	4/11/2003	241,695
	Minolta Di550	8/16/2001	126,985
2011-020	Sharp AR-BC320	4/30/2005	126,435 b&w
			69,530 color
2011-021	Minolta Di250	01/28/2000	149,927

**Background**

The City published on February 10, 2011 a Notice to Bidders in the *Williamson Herald* for purchase of a minimum of five (5) new commercial-grade multifunction copiers, some by June 30, 2011 and some after; maintenance services for said new copiers; and removal and disposal of surplus copiers currently owned by the City. In addition, bid documents were sent on or about the same date directly to twelve (12) potential bidders known or thought to be interested in this solicitation. Bids from three (3) vendors were publicly opened at the bid opening held on February 24, 2011. A tabulation of the bids received for this solicitation is attached.

**Financial Impact**

The apparent lowest, most responsive and responsible bid, from NovaCopy, Inc. of Nashville, is in the total estimated amount of \$90,294.60 for purchase of six (6) new commercial-grade multifunction copiers for various departments of the City (\$42,435.00), various per-click charges for maintenance services for said new copiers for the specified estimated respective volumes over the specified estimated 60-month service life (\$47,859.60), and removal and disposal of six (6) surplus copiers currently owned by the City (\$0.00). This bid was identified because it is the lowest responsive and responsible bid that meets or exceeds the City's intention as expressed and implied by the City's specifications as well as the instructions, terms and conditions pertaining to this procurement solicitation.

As noted above, the purchase of the specified machines has two categories of financial impacts on the City – one that is incurred upon placing the order for the machines and equals the purchase price of the machines themselves, and one that is incurred as the machines are used for copying and printing and equals the various per-click charges for maintenance services over the service lives of the machines. For bid analysis purposes only, the bid



documents specified an estimated service life of 60 months. The City's experience has been that our copiers typically last more than five (5) years.

The machine specified for the Finance Department is proposed for purchase next fiscal year. The other five (5) machines are proposed for purchase this current fiscal year. The two (2) machines specified for the Water Management Department (one at the department headquarters front office and one at the Water Reclamation Facility office) would be allocated to the Sewer Fund. The other four (4) machines would be allocated to the General Fund. Thus, if this award is approved, the financial impact by City fund and by fiscal year of the purchase price of the machines themselves would be as follows:

<b>General Fund, FY2011</b>		
<b>Procurement Solicitation No.</b>	<b>City Office</b>	<b>Purchase Price<sup>1</sup></b>
2011-017	Administration Department mail room	\$6,645.00
2011-018A	Municipal Information Technology Department	\$6,645.00
2011-019	Fleet Maintenance office	\$5,600.00
<b>General Fund FY2011 Total:</b>		<b>\$18,890.00</b>
<b>General Fund, FY2012</b>		
2011-018B	Finance Department	\$11,547.00
<b>General Fund FY2012 Total:</b>		<b>\$11,547.00</b>
<b>Sewer Fund, FY2011</b>		
2011-020	Water Management Headquarters front office	\$8,366.00
2011-021	Water Reclamation Facility office	\$3,632.00
<b>Sewer Fund FY2011 Total:</b>		<b>\$11,998.00</b>

<sup>1</sup> As bid by lowest responsive, responsible bidder.



The financial impact of the various per-click charges for maintenance services over the actual service lives of the machines would be allocated to the same departments and funds that are using the machines and would be spread over the fiscal years as the machines are used. In the table below, the per-click charges for maintenance services are estimated on a per month basis, as follows:

Sol. No.	City Office	Black & White Maintenance Services			Color Maintenance Services			Estimated Total MS per month
		Unit price per image <sup>1</sup>	Specified estimated # of B&W images per month	Estimated B&W MS per month	Unit price per image <sup>1</sup>	Specified estimated # of color images per month	Estimated Color MS per month	
2011-017	Admin.	\$0.00765	4,500	\$34.43	\$0.04390	1,500	\$65.85	\$100.28
2011-018A	MIT	\$0.00765	4,000	\$30.60	\$0.04390	3,000	\$131.70	\$162.30
2011-018B	Finance	\$0.00534	10,000	\$53.40	\$0.03610	3,000	\$108.30	\$161.70
2011-019	Fleet	\$0.00765	4,500	\$34.43	\$0.04390	1,500	\$65.85	\$100.28
2011-020	WMD HQ	\$0.00612	8,500	\$52.02	\$0.03870	4,500	\$174.15	\$226.17
2011-021	WRF	\$0.00932	2,000	\$18.64	\$0.05660	500	\$28.30	\$46.94

**Options**

In accordance with the bid documents, the City reserves the right to reject any and all bids.

**Recommendation**

Staff recommends that the City accept the apparent lowest best bid, from NovaCopy, Inc. of Nashville, TN in the total estimated amount of \$90,294.60 for purchase of six (6) new commercial-grade multifunction copiers for various departments of the City (\$42,435.00), various per-click charges for maintenance services for said new copiers for the specified estimated respective volumes over the specified estimated 60-month service life (\$47,859.60), and removal and disposal of six (6) surplus copiers currently owned by the City (\$0.00). Purchasing Manager Brian Wilcox is of the opinion that the prepared specifications as distributed allowed for competition among multiple vendors, and that the staff recommendation appears to be made in a fair and impartial manner based upon the bids received.