



MEMORANDUM

February 4, 2011

TO: Board of Mayor and Aldermen

FROM: Eric J. Gardner, P.E., Director of Engineering
Eric Stuckey, City Administrator

SUBJECT: Eastern Flank Battlefield Park
Access Roadway Improvement

Purpose

The purpose of this memo is to request direction from the Franklin Board of Mayor and Aldermen (BOMA) as to how staff should proceed with the access roadway for the Eastern Flank Battlefield Park Project.

Background

The BOMA approved funding for providing access to the Eastern Flank Battlefield Park (EFBP) in an amount of \$300,000 on July 13, 2010 as part of Resolution 2010-56. Staff brought forward a professional services agreement (PSA) with Littlejohn Engineering to complete the design for the access roadway. The BOMA choose not to proceed with the PSA and expressed a desire construct the roadway through a design-build method. Staff later informed the BOMA that under state law, the City could not use the design-build process for this project.

After learning of BOMA desires concerning the proposed access roadway, staff started reviewing the implications and discussing options. The following are some of the concerns mentioned by staff;

1. If the eastern portion of the roadway is to be used for two-way traffic during normal times, then the desired 18' wide roadway is not adequate, especially considering the expected, or anticipated, bus traffic. An 18' wide roadway would create difficulties for buses passing each other and for any other vehicles when there is someone stopping to observe the view-sheds that are proposed for the park. For this situation; two-way traffic with bus use; the roadway would need to be twenty-two feet (22') wide. An 18' wide roadway may be adequate if the roadway is to only function as one-way at all times.
2. Removal of curb and gutter – there was never a curb and gutter designed for this roadway. There is designed a “ribbon curb” that is to be flush with the pavement. This “ribbon curb” is to protect the edges of the pavement and provide a longer life roadway (sustainability). If there is no curb then vehicles running on and off the pavement will break down the pavement edges that will create continuing maintenance for the Parks and/or Streets Departments, especially if the roadway width is to be only 18'.
3. Staff does not believe that \$300,000 is adequate to fund the construction of even the eastern portion of the proposed access roadway, much less the entire loop roadway even with the western portion being graded and graveled only.
4. There has been no mention of what additional improvements are to be constructed or of what material they are to be constructed. These additional improvements include, but may not be limited to; sidewalk at the turnaround drop-off area with handicap ramps, required drainage improvements with end and head walls (believe end and head walls should be either stacked rock or rock veneer concrete), bio-retention areas, connection to the Carnton Mansion access at the end of Carnton Lane, parking area material, etc. If the connection to the Carnton Mansion access is to be made and special event traffic is



to use Carnton Lane as an exit, then there would not be any demolition for any of Carnton Lane, but there would still need to be a cul-de-sac constructed for normal traffic operations.

Staff reviewed the existing plans for the access roadway for the EFBP and developed several options to provide the access roadway improvements for the eastern portion of the development with a connection to the Carnton Mansion access at the end of Carnton Lane. The options do not include the construction of the cul-de-sac at the end of Carnton Lane at this time. As can be seen from the attached Cost Estimate there are three (3) basic options with multiple options within each of the options. From the Cost Estimate you can see that the cost to provide the eastern portion of the access road to the Eastern Flank Battlefield Park range from approximately \$450,000 to approximately \$1,385,000. The estimates are based on pricing experienced during recent bids in conjunction with quantities and estimated unit price as supplied by our consultant for this project.

Options

Below is a listing of options as to how the City can proceed with the delivery of the design of the Eastern Flank Battlefield Park Access Roadway Project.

1. Seek Request for Qualifications (RFQ) from consulting firms for the design of the project.
2. Accept the June 29, 2010 proposal from Littlejohn Engineering Associates for the design of the access roadway improvements (see attached).
3. Negotiate with Littlejohn Engineering Associates for a less expensive design for the improvements.
4. Seek a proposal from another consulting firm that has proven their qualifications to BOMA for this type design.

Recommendation

There is no recommendation for this issue at this time. The information in this memo is for BOMA to know the limitations as to the project delivery method and what can be expected as per the cost of providing the access road to the Eastern Flank Battlefield Park. As BOMA is aware, this cost is very dependent upon what is to be included in the project. Staff is prepared to continue with delivery of this project as per the directions indicated by BOMA.

Eastern Flank Battlefield Roadway Cost Estimate

Option 1 - Asphalt with Exposed Aggregate

	Ribbon Curb	W/O Ribbon Curb
18' Pavement without Parking	\$532,815.79	\$450,655.79
22' Pavement without Parking	\$581,527.08	\$499,367.08
18' Pavement with Pervious Parking	\$850,241.79	\$768,081.79
22' Pavement with Pervious Parking	\$898,953.08	\$816,793.08
18' Pavement with Gravel Parking	\$701,939.79	\$619,779.79
22' Pavement with Gravel Parking	\$750,651.08	\$668,491.08

Option 2 - Concrete with Exposed Aggregate

	Ribbon Curb	W/O Ribbon Curb
18' Concrete without Parking	\$930,655.62	\$848,495.62
22' Concrete without Parking	\$1,067,775.76	\$985,615.76
18' Concrete with Pervious Parking	\$1,248,081.62	\$1,165,921.62
22' Concrete with Pervious Parking	\$1,385,201.76	\$1,303,041.76
18' Concrete with Gravel Parking	\$1,099,779.62	\$1,017,619.62
22' Concrete with Gravel Parking	\$1,236,899.76	\$1,154,739.76

Option 3 - Double Bituminous Surface Treatment

	Ribbon Curb	W/O Ribbon Curb
18' DBST without Parking	\$546,668.64	\$464,508.64
22' DBST without Parking	\$598,458.34	\$516,298.34
18' DBST with Pervious Parking	\$864,094.64	\$781,934.64
22' DBST with Pervious Parking	\$915,884.34	\$833,724.34
18' DBST with Gravel Parking	\$715,792.64	\$633,632.64
22' DBST with Gravel Parking	\$767,582.34	\$685,422.34

