




HISTORIC
FRANKLIN
TENNESSEE

ITEM #14
WRKS 12/14/2010

MEMORANDUM

December 6, 2010

TO: Board of Mayor and Aldermen

FROM: Eric S. Stuckey, City Administrator 
Russell Truell, Assistant City Administrator / CFO
Lisa Clayton, Parks Director
Brian Wilcox, Purchasing Manager

SUBJECT: Consideration of bid award to Happy Tree, Inc. of Franklin, TN in the amount of \$19,956 for tree supply, planting and related contract services for the Parks Department (Purchasing Office Procurement Solicitation No. 2011-009; up to \$30,000 authorized by the Tree Commission to be transferred from Tree Bank to 110-84620-44700 for Fiscal Year 2011)

Purpose

The purpose of this procurement is to purchase the supply and planting of thirteen (13) varieties of trees, and related contract services. The trees are to be planted at the following locations:

- Jim Warren Park (36 trees)
- Pinkerton Park (2)
- Fieldstone Park (104)
- Liberty Park (15)

Background

The City's Tree Commission voted on October 25, 2010 to recommend the use of up to \$30,000 from the City's tree bank reserves for this year's round of tree planting.

Financial Impact

The City published on November 4, 2010 a Notice to Bidders in the *Williamson Herald* for tree supply, planting and related contract services. In addition, bid documents were sent on or about the same date directly to nine (9) potential bidders known or thought to be interested in this solicitation. Bids from four (4) vendors were publicly opened at the bid opening held on November 18, 2010. A tabulation of the bids received for this solicitation is attached. The apparent lowest, most responsive and responsible bid for the specified estimated quantities of each specified variety of tree, totaling 157 trees, is from Happy Tree, Inc. of Franklin. This bid was identified because it is the lowest bid that meets or exceeds the City's intention as expressed and implied by the City's specifications as well as the instructions, terms and conditions pertaining to this procurement solicitation.

The total value of the Happy Tree bid based on the specified estimated quantities, totaling 157 trees, and the bidder's quoted unit prices for the specified varieties of trees, is in the total amount of \$19,956. As the City's specifications indicated, "The exact quantities of trees to be planted pursuant to this procurement solicitation shall be determined by the City after the bids have been submitted." However, the Parks Department now recommends that the estimated quantities be used for the award.

If the Board of Mayor and Aldermen approves this bid award, then the invoice(s) totaling the amount of this bid award (\$19,956) would be allocated to the Parks Department's General Fund budget for fiscal year 2011, and a like amount would be transferred from the City's tree bank reserves to cover those expenses.



HISTORIC
FRANKLIN
TENNESSEE

MEMORANDUM

Options

In accordance with the bid documents, the City reserves the right to reject any and all bids.

Recommendation

Staff recommends that the City accept the apparent lowest best bid, from Happy Tree, Inc. of Franklin, and that the value of the award be in the amount of \$19,956 for the recommended quantities for the specified varieties of trees, totaling 157 trees. Purchasing Manager Brian Wilcox is of the opinion that the prepared specifications as distributed allowed for competition among multiple vendors, and that the staff recommendation appears to be made in a fair and impartial manner based upon the bids received.

Tabulation of Bids*

Purchasing Office Solicitation No.:		2011-009 (tree supply, planting and related contract services)						
Notice to Bidders published in the <i>Williamson Herald</i> on:		11/4/10						
Number of vendors that were notified of / that responded to this solicitation for bids:		9 / 4						
Date and time bids due and publicly opened:		11/18/10 2:00 PM						
Present at opening of bids:		Marty Shaw of Happy Tree and Joel Tomlin of Office of Joel Tomlin; Todd Snackenber of the City of Franklin Parks Department; and Tiffany Wilkins and Brian Wilcox of the City of Franklin Purchasing Office						
Target meeting of BOMA at which recommendation will be considered:		12/14/10						
Bids received from:	Bid No.:	Bid description:	Does the bid MOES¹? / If not, how many exceptions do not MOES¹?	Total value of bid based on <u>specified estimated</u> quantities² and quoted unit prices:	Total value of bid based on <u>recom-mended</u> quantities³ and quoted unit prices:	Payment terms:	Estimated time of completion of project after receipt of order:	Bid and associated pricing is valid and may be accepted through:
CurbAppeal, Inc. 114 Reynolds Dr. Franklin, TN 37064 Simon Shelton, President 615/403-4379	1 of 1	tree supply, planting and related contract services	No / 1 (bidder did not schedule and attend a mandatory pre-bid appointment)	\$28,365.00	\$28,365.00	net 30 days	5 days	03/01/11
Haller's Landscaping & Lawncare 370 Taggart Haller Lane Sparta, TN 38583 Patrick Haller, Owner 931/261-5885	1 of 1	tree supply, planting and related contract services	Bidder takes no exceptions	\$38,990.50	\$38,990.50	net 30 days	120 days	03/31/11
Happy Tree, Inc. 605 Laurel Ct. (37064) P.O. Box 680716 Franklin, TN 37068-0716 Martin Shaw, President & CEO 615/794-4377	1 of 1	tree supply, planting and related contract services	Bidder takes no exceptions	\$19,956.00	\$19,956.00	net 30 days	21 days	03/31/11
Office of Joel Tomlin, III, LLC 4115 Mallory Lane, Suite 100-C Franklin, TN 37067 Joel Tomlin, III, President 615/445-5694	1 of 1	tree supply, planting and related contract services	Bidder takes no exceptions	\$21,980.00	\$21,980.00	net 30 days	60 days	01/31/11
¹ MOES indicates "meet(s) or exceed(s) specifications"								
² The estimated quantity for each tree variety indicated above represents the approximate number of trees that the Parks Department anticipated, at the time specifications were released, planting pursuant to this procurement solicitation. These numbers are estimates only and do not represent a guaranteed minimum or maximum. For purposes of bid evaluation, the City will use the estimated quantities indicated above to determine the total value of each bid.								
³ The recommended quantities for each tree variety indicated above represents the number of trees that the Parks Department recommends planting pursuant to this procurement solicitation. In accordance with the specifications, the exact quantities of trees to be planted pursuant to this procurement solicitation shall be determined by the City after the bids have been submitted.								

**City of Franklin, Tennessee
Tabulation of Bids***

No.	Variety	Total specified estimated quantities at all jobsites	Total recommended quantities at all jobsites	Curb Appeal, Inc.			Haller's Landscaping & Lawncare			Happy Tree, Inc.			Office of Joel Tomlin, III, L.L.C.		
				Quoted unit price by variety per planted tree	Total value of bid based on specified estimated quantities and recommended quantities and quoted unit prices	Quoted unit price by variety per planted tree	Total value of bid based on specified estimated quantities and recommended quantities and quoted unit prices	Quoted unit price by variety per planted tree	Total value of bid based on specified estimated quantities and recommended quantities and quoted unit prices	Quoted unit price by variety per planted tree	Total value of bid based on specified estimated quantities and recommended quantities and quoted unit prices	Quoted unit price by variety per planted tree	Total value of bid based on specified estimated quantities and recommended quantities and quoted unit prices	Quoted unit price by variety per planted tree	Total value of bid based on specified estimated quantities and recommended quantities and quoted unit prices
1	Eastern Red Cedar (Juniperus virginiana)	25	25	\$175.00	\$4,375.00	\$212.50	\$5,312.50	\$120.00	\$3,000.00	\$120.00	\$3,000.00	\$120.00	\$3,000.00	\$120.00	\$3,000.00
2	Loblolly Pine (Pinus taeda)	20	20	\$175.00	\$3,500.00	\$203.50	\$4,070.00	\$96.00	\$1,920.00	\$96.00	\$1,920.00	\$120.00	\$2,400.00	\$120.00	\$2,400.00
3	Virginia Pine (Pinus virginiana)	16	16	\$180.00	\$2,880.00	\$203.50	\$3,256.00	\$96.00	\$1,536.00	\$96.00	\$1,536.00	\$120.00	\$1,920.00	\$120.00	\$1,920.00
4	Eastern White Pine (Pinus strobus)	15	15	\$175.00	\$2,625.00	\$215.50	\$3,232.50	\$70.00	\$1,050.00	\$70.00	\$1,050.00	\$120.00	\$1,800.00	\$120.00	\$1,800.00
5	Northern Red Oak (Quercus rubra)	5	5	\$185.00	\$925.00	\$278.50	\$1,392.50	\$130.00	\$650.00	\$130.00	\$650.00	\$155.00	\$775.00	\$155.00	\$775.00
6	Blackgum (Nyssa sylvatica)	5	5	\$185.00	\$925.00	\$265.00	\$1,325.00	\$150.00	\$750.00	\$150.00	\$750.00	\$165.00	\$825.00	\$165.00	\$825.00
7	Sweetgum (seedless) (Rotundiloba)	16	16	\$185.00	\$2,960.00	\$254.50	\$4,072.00	\$130.00	\$2,080.00	\$130.00	\$2,080.00	\$165.00	\$2,640.00	\$165.00	\$2,640.00
8	Nuttall Oak (Quercus texana)	5	5	\$185.00	\$925.00	\$248.50	\$1,242.50	\$90.00	\$450.00	\$90.00	\$450.00	\$155.00	\$775.00	\$155.00	\$775.00
9	Redbud (Cercis canadensis)	2	2	\$185.00	\$370.00	\$257.50	\$515.00	\$130.00	\$260.00	\$130.00	\$260.00	\$145.00	\$290.00	\$145.00	\$290.00
10	Little Gum Magnolia (Magnolia grandiflora 'little gem')	17	17	\$185.00	\$3,145.00	\$355.00	\$6,035.00	\$200.00	\$3,400.00	\$200.00	\$3,400.00	\$170.00	\$2,890.00	\$170.00	\$2,890.00
11	Southern Magnolia (Magnolia grandiflora)	15	15	\$185.00	\$2,775.00	\$287.50	\$4,312.50	\$184.00	\$2,760.00	\$184.00	\$2,760.00	\$145.00	\$2,175.00	\$145.00	\$2,175.00
12	Big Leaf Magnolia (Magnolia macrophylla)	6	6	\$185.00	\$1,110.00	\$290.00	\$1,740.00	\$200.00	\$1,200.00	\$200.00	\$1,200.00	\$165.00	\$990.00	\$165.00	\$990.00
13	Sugar Maple (Acer saccharum)	10	10	\$185.00	\$1,850.00	\$248.50	\$2,485.00	\$90.00	\$900.00	\$90.00	\$900.00	\$150.00	\$1,500.00	\$150.00	\$1,500.00
Grand totals:				157	\$28,365.00	\$38,990.50	\$19,956.00	\$21,980.00	\$19,956.00	\$21,980.00	\$19,956.00	\$21,980.00	\$21,980.00	\$21,980.00	\$21,980.00