



HISTORIC  
FRANKLIN  
TENNESSEE

ITEM #41  
BOMA  
11/23/2010

## MEMORANDUM

November 17, 2010

**TO:** Board of Mayor and Aldermen

**FROM:** Eric S. Stuckey, City Administrator  
Russell Truell, Assistant City Administrator / CFO  
Lisa Clayton, Parks Director  
Brad Wilson, Facilities and Project Manager  
Brian Wilcox, Purchasing Manager

**SUBJECT:** Consideration of bid award to Crutcher & Associates, LLC of Franklin in the amount of \$31,800.00 for replacement of the awning fabric, framing and posts on Battle Park Hall at Eastern Flank Battle Park for the Parks Department (Purchasing Office Procurement Solicitation No. 2011-008)

### Purpose

The purpose of this procurement is to replace the four (4) awnings on Battle Park Hall at Eastern Flank Battle Park, 1343 Carnton Lane.

### Background

Battle Park Hall at Eastern Flank Battle Park received substantial damage, including to the awnings, by high winds and heavy rain during the May 1-2, 2010 rain event.

Within the context of the bidding process, the City sought competitive pricing, on a lump-sum basis, for the following two alternate scopes of work:

- Alternate scope of work no. 1: Remove and replace existing fabric with new fabric on existing framing and posts for the four (4) existing awnings at the job site. A City of Franklin permit and plans stamped by a professional engineer would not be required for alternate scope of work no. 1.
- Alternate scope of work no. 2: Remove and replace existing fabric, framing and posts with new fabric, framing and posts for the four (4) existing awnings at the job site. A City of Franklin permit and plans stamped by a professional engineer would be required for alternate scope of work no. 2.

### Financial Impact

The City published on November 4, 2010 a Notice to Bidders in the *Williamson Herald* for removal and replacement of awning materials with new for Eastern Flank Battlefield Park main facility at 1343 Carnton Lane, Franklin. In addition, bid documents were sent on or about the same date directly to fourteen (14) potential bidders known or thought to be interested in this solicitation. Bids from three (3) vendors were publicly opened at the bid opening held on November 16, 2010. A tabulation of the bids received for this solicitation is attached.

The apparent lowest responsive and responsible bid, from Crutcher & Associates, LLC of Franklin, is in the amount of \$12,432.00 for alternate scope of work no. 1, and in the amount of \$31,800.00 for alternate scope of work no. 2. This bid was identified because it is the lowest bid that meets or exceeds the City's intention as expressed and implied by the City's specifications as well as the instructions, terms and conditions pertaining to this procurement solicitation.

This awning project is not yet budgeted. The City will be pursuing reimbursement for this project once it is completed. Battle Park Hall is an insured property, so the City will be filing an insurance claim. A portion of the



HISTORIC  
FRANKLIN  
TENNESSEE

## MEMORANDUM

---

loss not covered by insurance may be reimbursed by FEMA. However, it is possible that none of the project will be reimbursable.

### **Options**

1. The City could accept the apparent lowest best bid for alternate scope of work no. 1 (replace the awning fabric only and not the framing and posts) in the amount of \$12,432.00.
2. The City could accept the apparent lowest best bid for alternate scope of work no. 2 (replace the awning fabric, framing and posts) in the amount of \$31,800.00.
3. In accordance with the bid documents, the City reserves the right to reject any and all bids.

### **Recommendation**

In order to minimize the opportunity for surprises that could be encountered either during or after a retrofit, staff recommends that the City accept the apparent lowest best bid, from Crutcher & Associates, LLC of Franklin, in the amount of \$31,800.00 for replacement of the awning fabric, framing and posts. Purchasing Manager Brian Wilcox is of the opinion that the prepared specifications as distributed allowed for competition among multiple vendors, and that the staff recommendation appears to be made in a fair and impartial manner based upon the bids received.

**Tabulation of Bids\***

|   |  |
|---|--|
| <b>Purchasing Office Solicitation No.:</b>  | 2011-008 (replace awnings for Battle Park Hall)  |
| <b>Notice to Bidders published in the <i>Williamson Herald</i> on:</b>                        | 11/4/10  |
| <b>Number of vendors that were notified of/ that responded to this solicitation for bids:</b> | 14 / 3   |
| <b>Date and time bids due and publicly opened:</b>  | 11/16/10 2:00 PM   |
| <b>Present at opening of bids:</b>  | Ron Crutcher of Crutcher & Associates; Anna Shuford of the City of Franklin Parks Department; and Tiffany Wilkins and Brian Wilcox of the City of Franklin Purchasing Office |
| <b>Target meeting of BOMA at which recommendation will be considered:</b>                     | 11/23/10   |

| Bids received from:   | Bid No.: | Description of Bid:                                   | Does the bid MOES <sup>1</sup> ? / If not, how many exceptions do not MOES <sup>1</sup> ?   | Total delivered bid price, per unit: | Manufacturer's warranty (years) / Installer's guarantee (years): | Payment terms: | Estimated time of completion after receipt of order: | Bid price per unit is valid through: |
|---|----------|---|---|--------------------------------------|--|----------------|--|--------------------------------------|
| Alabama Awnings Co., Inc.<br>4617 Huntsville Rd.<br>Florence, AL 35630<br>Jared A. Hicks, Officer<br>256/275-1666 | 1 of 2   | Alt. Scope of Work No. 1 (replace fabric only)        | Bidder takes no exceptions; however, CoF notes deficiencies (CoF Bid Submittal Form is not signed and dated; vendor-supplied description of bid and CoF specifications marked by the bidder are not included; expiration date of bid not clear)   | \$10,744.00                          | 5 / 5  | net 30 days    | 30 calendar days                                     | unclear                              |
|   | 2 of 2   | Alt. Scope of Work No. 2 (replace fabric and framing) |   | \$20,145.00                          | 5 / 5  |                | 45 calendar days                                     |                                      |
| Crutcher & Associates, LLC<br>1324 Adams St.<br>Franklin, TN 37064<br>Ronald Crutcher, Owner<br>615/210-1593      | 1 of 2   | Alt. Scope of Work No. 1 (replace fabric only)        | Bidder takes no exceptions; however, "sample" agreement as submitted by bidder is rejected by CoF   | \$12,432.00                          | 5 / 2  | net 30 days    | 21 calendar days                                     | 12/31/10                             |
|   | 2 of 2   | Alt. Scope of Work No. 2 (replace fabric and framing) |   | \$31,800.00                          | 5 / 2  |                | 42 calendar days                                     |                                      |
| Nashville Tent & Awning Co.<br>1301 Herman St.<br>Nashville, TN 37208<br>David Aust, Sales<br>615/425-3155        | 1 of 2   | Alt. Scope of Work No. 1 (replace fabric only)        | Bidder takes no exceptions; however, CoF notes deficiencies (vendor-supplied description of bid, CoF specifications marked by the bidder, references, CoF standard procurement terms & conditions, and affidavits of non-collusion, drug-free workplace and Title VI compliance are not included; expiration date of bid not clear) | \$12,885.00                          | 5 / 1  | net 30 days    | 28 calendar days                                     | unclear                              |
|   | 2 of 2   | Alt. Scope of Work No. 2 (replace fabric and framing) |   | no bid                               | no bid   |                | no bid   |                                      |
|   |          |   |   |                                      |  |                |  |                                      |
|   |          |   |   |                                      |  |                |  |                                      |
|   |          |   |   |                                      |  |                |  |                                      |

<sup>1</sup>MOES indicates "meet(s) or exceed(s) specifications"

\*Shaded bid is apparent lowest best bid