



HISTORIC
FRANKLIN
TENNESSEE

ITEM #17
WRKS 10/26/2010

MEMORANDUM

October 18, 2010

TO: Board of Mayor and Aldermen

FROM: Eric S. Stuckey, City Administrator *ES*
Russell Truell, Assistant City Administrator / CFO
Lisa Clayton, Parks Director
Brad Wilson, Facilities and Project Manager
Brian Wilcox, Purchasing Manager

SUBJECT: Consideration of bid award to Jewell General Contracting & Roofing, LLC, d/b/a Jewell Roofing & Gutters, of Springfield, TN in the estimated amount of \$22,314.60 for reroofing Battle Park Hall at Eastern Flank Battle Park for the Parks Department (Purchasing Office Procurement Solicitation No. 2011-004)

Purpose

The purpose of this procurement is to remove and dispose of the existing asphalt shingle roof and install a new asphalt shingle roof on Battle Park Hall at the Eastern Flank Battle Park, 1343 Carnton Lane.

Background

Battle Park Hall at Eastern Flank Battle Park received substantial damage, including to the roof, by high winds and heavy rain during the May 1-2, 2010 rain event. This roofing project is not yet budgeted. A City of Franklin permit is not required for this project. However, the project must be completed in compliance with rules and regulations enforced by the City of Franklin Department of Building and Neighborhood Services.

Financial Impact

The City published on September 23, 2010 a Notice to Bidders in the *Williamson Herald* for removal and replacement of asphalt shingle roofing materials with new for Battle Park Hall at Eastern Flank Battle Park. In addition, bid documents were sent on or about the same date directly to six (6) potential bidders known or thought to be interested in this solicitation. A bid from one (1) vendor was publicly opened at the bid opening held on October 7, 2010. A tabulation of the bid received for this solicitation is attached. The apparent lowest, most responsive and responsible bid, from Jewell General Contracting & Roofing, LLC, d/b/a Jewell Roofing & Gutters, of Springfield, TN, is in the total amount of \$22,314.60 for the specified estimated quantities. This bid was identified because it is the lowest bid that meets or exceeds the City's intention as expressed and implied by the City's specifications as well as the instructions, terms and conditions pertaining to this procurement solicitation.

At the recommendation of Facilities and Project Manager Brad Wilson, the City's bid solicitation sought pricing for two different kinds of asphalt shingle roofing material – a standard three-tab asphalt shingle, and a thicker dimensional or architectural asphalt shingle. For the one bid received, the dimensional asphalt shingle is priced at \$2,146.80 (11%) more than the three-tab asphalt shingle. Note that the three-tab shingle material comes with a 20-year manufacturer's warranty while the dimensional shingle comes with a 30-year manufacturer's warranty. The additional warranty and improved appearance of the dimensional shingle is viewed by staff as good value for the added cost. It is worth noting that even the dimensional shingle option is well below the FEMA estimate for this job which is \$27,393.00.

Also at the recommendation of Facilities and Project Manager Brad Wilson, the City's bid solicitation sought pricing on a contingency, per-unit basis for three specified materials in case they would be needed. The need for



HISTORIC
FRANKLIN
TENNESSEE

MEMORANDUM

these materials is difficult to verify until the old roofing material has been removed. For purposes of bid analysis only, estimated quantities of these materials were specified and are included in the award recommendation. However, the need for these materials and the respective quantities, if any, will be determined as the project progresses.

The City will be pursuing reimbursement for this project once it is completed. Battle Park Hall is an insured property, so the City will be filing an insurance claim. Any portion of the loss not covered by insurance may be reimbursed by FEMA.

Options

In accordance with the bid documents, the City reserves the right to reject any and all bids.

Recommendation

Staff recommends that the City accept the apparent lowest best bid, from Jewell General Contracting & Roofing, LLC, d/b/a Jewell Roofing & Gutters, of Springfield, TN, in the total amount of \$22,314.60 for replacing the existing roofing materials with dimensional or architectural asphalt shingle material and for the specified estimated quantities of contingency materials. Purchasing Manager Brian Wilcox is of the opinion that the prepared specifications as distributed allowed for competition among multiple vendors, and that the staff recommendation appears to be made in a fair and impartial manner based upon the bids received.

City of Franklin, Tennessee
Tabulation of Bids *

| | | | | | | | | | |
|--|---------------------|---|---|--------------------------|-------------------------|---|-----------------------|---|---|
| Purchasing Office Solicitation No.: | | 2011-004 (reroofing Battle Park Hall at Eastern Flank Battle Park) | | | | | | | |
| Notice to Bidders published in the <i>Williamson Herald</i> on: | | 9/23/10 | | | | | | | |
| Number of vendors that were notified of / that responded to this solicitation for bids: | | 6 / 1 | | | | | | | |
| Date and time bids due and publicly opened: | | 10/7/10 2:00 PM | | | | | | | |
| Present at opening of bids: | | Chris Gant of Jewell Roofing & Gutters; Brad Wilson of the City of Franklin Administration Department; and Brian Wilcox of the City of Franklin Purchasing Office | | | | | | | |
| Target meeting of BOMA at which recommendation will be considered: | | 11/9/10 | | | | | | | |
| Bids received from: | Bid No.: | Description: | Does/Do the bid item(s) MOES¹? / If not, how many exceptions do not MOES¹? | Bid unit pricing: | Unit of measure: | Total delivered bid price based on specified estimated quantities: | Payment terms: | Estimated time of delivery after receipt of order: | Bid price per unit is valid through: |
| | 1 of 5 | replace with three-tab shingle (20-yr warranty; 12-mo guarantee) | | \$19,611.80 | job | \$19,611.80 | | | |
| Jewell General Contracting & Roofing, LLC d/b/a Jewell Roofing & Gutters 821 Hillside Dr. Springfield, TN 37172 Chris Gant, Commercial Estimator 615/642-1371 | 2 of 5 | replace with dimensional type shingle (30-yr warranty; 12-mo guarantee) | Bidder takes no exceptions | \$21,758.60 | job | \$21,758.60 | net 30 days | 5 calendar days | 12/01/10 |
| | 3 of 5 | contingency 1"x6" wood | | \$2.25 | lineal foot | \$36.00 | | | |
| | 4 of 5 | contingency plywood | | \$72.00 | 4'x8' sheet | \$360.00 | | | |
| | 5 of 5 | contingency new flashing in the wall | | \$10.00 | lineal foot | \$160.00 | | | |
| | Total of 1 and 3-5: | | | n/a | n/a | \$20,167.80 | | | |
| | Total of 2 and 3-5: | | | n/a | n/a | \$22,314.60 | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | |

¹MOES indicates "meet(s) or exceed(s) specifications"

*Shaded bid is apparent lowest best bid