



HISTORIC
FRANKLIN
TENNESSEE

ITEM #8
FINANCE
04-26-10

MEMORANDUM

April 15, 2010

TO: Board of Mayor and Aldermen

FROM: Eric S. Stuckey, City Administrator
Russell Truell, Assistant City Administrator / CFO
Lisa Clayton, Parks Director
Brian Wilcox, Purchasing Manager

SUBJECT: Consideration of bid award to Maury Fence Co. of Columbia, TN in the amount of \$120,000.00 (\$90,000.00 in FY2010; \$30,000.00 in FY2011 if budgeted) for supply, delivery and installation of fencing At Fieldstone Park ball fields for the Parks Department (Purchasing Office Procurement Solicitation No. 2010-035; \$90,000.00 Budgeted In 110-89530-44700 for fiscal year 2010)

Purpose

The purpose of this procurement is to purchase the supply, delivery and installation of new fencing for the ballfields at Fieldstone Park. This new fencing would replace existing fencing at this same location that is 23 years old and in poor condition.

Background

The Parks Department budget for fiscal year 2010 allocates \$90,000 out of the General Fund for the purchase of replacement athletic field fencing at Fieldstone Park.

Financial Impact

The City published on March 25, 2010 a Notice to Bidders in the *Williamson Herald* for the supply, delivery and installation of fencing at Fieldstone Park ballfields. In addition, bid documents were sent on or about the same date directly to eight (8) potential bidders known or thought to be interested in this solicitation. Bids from three (3) vendors were publicly opened at the bid opening held on April 15, 2010. A tabulation of the bids received for this solicitation is attached. The apparent lowest, most responsive and responsible bid, from Maury Fence Co. of Columbia, TN, is in the amount of \$30,000.00 per field or \$120,000.00 for the specified four (4) fields. This bid was identified because it is the lowest bid that meets or exceeds the City's intention as expressed and implied by the City's specifications as well as the instructions, terms and conditions pertaining to this procurement solicitation. The budget for FY2010 anticipated this project costing \$45,000.00 per field so, on a per-field basis, the apparent lowest best bid amount is \$15,000.00 (33%) under budget.

Options

The specifications included the following provision:

Bid evaluation, award and authorization to proceed: The City will use the quoted pricing for fencing for all four ballfields to evaluate the bids. The City intends for all of the fencing work to be done at Fieldstone Park ball complex to be awarded to one (1) single vendor. However, the City cannot guarantee that fencing work for fields nos. 3 & 4 will be authorized. Therefore, bidders should prepare pricing based on the assumption that two (2) separate authorizations to proceed will be issued – the first for fields nos. 1 & 2 to be issued possibly as soon as May 12, 2010 but no later than May 28, 2010, and the second for fields nos. 3 & 4 to be issued possibly as soon as July 1, 2010 but no later than July 31, 2010.



HISTORIC
FRANKLIN
TENNESSEE

MEMORANDUM

Because the bid prices came in so much below budget, staff recommends BOMA award the project with three fields to be funded in the current fiscal year and the one remaining field to be funded in fiscal year 2011 if budgeted. Maury Fence Co. has agreed to this schedule if it is awarded the project.

In accordance with the bid documents, the City reserves the right to reject any and all bids.

Recommendation

Staff recommends that the City accept the apparent lowest best bid, from Maury Fence Co. of Columbia, TN, in the amount of \$120,000.00 for supply, delivery and installation of fencing at Fieldstone Park ball fields for the Parks Department. Staff further recommends that the award be split over two fiscal years, with three fields to be funded in the current fiscal year for a total of \$90,000.00 and the one remaining field to be funded in fiscal year 2011 if budgeted for \$30,000.00. Purchasing Manager Brian Wilcox is of the opinion that the prepared specifications as distributed allowed for competition among multiple vendors, and that the staff recommendation appears to be made in a fair and impartial manner based upon the bids received.

Tabulation of Bids *

Purchasing Office Solicitation No.:		2010-035 (fencing at Fieldstone Park ballfields)						
Notice to Bidders published in the <i>Williamson Herald</i> on:		3/25/10						
Number of vendors that were notified of / that responded to this solicitation for bids:		8 / 3						
Date and time bids due and publicly opened:		4/15/10 2:00 PM						
Present at opening of bids:		Curt Newby of Rio Grande Fence; Paige Cruse of the City of Franklin Parks Department; and Brian Wilcox of the City of Franklin Purchasing Office						
Target meeting of BOMA at which recommendation will be considered:		5/11/10						
Bids received from:	Bid No.:	Does the bid MOES ¹ ? / If not, how many exceptions do not MOES ¹ ?	Total delivered and installed bid price			Payment terms:	Estimated time of completion after receipt of order:	Bid is valid and may be accepted through:
			Base Bid (uncoated galvanized):	Alternate Bid No. 1 (black vinyl coated / extruded)	Alternate Bid No. 2 (black vinyl thermally fused):			
Bratton Bros. Services 418 E. Vine St. Murfreesboro, TN 37130 Michael Bratton, Owner 615/895-5433	Ballfield No. 1	No / 1 (pricing for Field Nos. 3 & 4 is not guaranteed through 7/31/2010)	\$28,987.00	\$35,658.00	\$35,658.00	net 30 days from date of invoice	45 days	05/31/10
	Ballfield No. 2		\$28,987.00	\$35,658.00	\$35,658.00			
	Ballfield No. 3		\$28,987.00	\$35,658.00	\$35,658.00			
	Ballfield No. 4		\$28,987.00	\$35,658.00	\$35,658.00			
	Grand total, all 4 ballfields:		\$115,948.00	\$142,632.00	\$142,632.00			
Maury Fence Co. 2634 Leah Dr. Columbia, TN 38401 Willie Hurd, President 931/381-2980	Ballfield No. 1	Bidder takes no exceptions	\$30,000.00	\$36,500.00	\$36,500.00	net 30 days from date of invoice	30 days	08/31/10
	Ballfield No. 2		\$30,000.00	\$36,500.00	\$36,500.00			
	Ballfield No. 3		\$30,000.00	\$36,500.00	\$36,500.00			
	Ballfield No. 4		\$30,000.00	\$36,500.00	\$36,500.00			
	Grand total, all 4 ballfields:		\$120,000.00	\$146,000.00	\$146,000.00			
Rio Grande Fence Co., Inc. 1410 Lebanon Rd. Nashville, TN 37210 Curt Newby, Project Manager 615/405-1197	Ballfield No. 1	Bidder takes no exceptions	\$37,261.00	\$42,536.00	\$44,987.00	net 30 days from date of invoice	60 days	05/31/10
	Ballfield No. 2		\$37,261.00	\$42,536.00	\$44,987.00			
	Ballfield No. 3		\$43,032.21	\$49,775.04	\$52,963.45			
	Ballfield No. 4		\$43,032.21	\$49,775.04	\$52,963.45			
	Grand total, all 4 ballfields:		\$160,586.42	\$184,622.08	\$195,900.90			

¹MOES indicates "meet(s) or exceed(s) specifications"

^{*}Shaded bid is apparent lowest best bid