

**FRANKLIN HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MINUTES
December 11, 2017**

The Franklin Historic Zoning Commission held a special meeting on Monday, December 11, 2017, at 5:00 pm in the City Hall Boardroom at 109 Third Avenue South.

Members Present: Mary Pearce
Mike Hathaway
Mel Thompson
Jeff Carson
Jim Roberts

Staff Present: Amanda Rose, Planning & Sustainability Department
Joey Bryan, Planning & Sustainability Department
James Svoboda, Planning & Sustainability Department
Kristen Corn, Law Department
Randall Tosh, BNS Department

**Item 1:
Call to Order**

Vice-Chairwoman Pearce called to order the December 11, 2017, Historic Zoning Commission meeting at 5:00 p.m.

**Item 2
Minutes: November 13, 2017**

Mr. Hathaway moved to approve the November 13, 2017 minutes. Mr. Roberts seconded the motion, and the motion passed 5-0.

**Item 3:
Consideration of 2018 Historic Zoning Commission and Design Review Committee Meeting Dates and Application/Notification Deadlines.**

Mr. Roberts moved to approve the 2018 Historic Zoning Commission and Design Review Committee Meeting Dates and Application/Notification Deadlines. Mr. Carson seconded the motion, and the motion passed 5-0.

**Item 4:
Staff Announcements.**

Mayor Moore acknowledged Mr. Mel Thompson's contribution to the commission and presented Mr. Thompson a clock for his service to the City. Mayor Moore thanked Mr. Thompson for all he has done for the commission.

Item 5:

Consideration of Requests to place non-agenda emergency items on the agenda.

No non-agenda items.

Item 6:

Citizens Comments on Items Not on the Agenda

Open for Franklin citizens to be heard on items not included on this Agenda. As provided by law, the Historic Zoning Commission shall make no decisions or consideration of action of citizen comments, except to refer the matter to the Planning Director for administrative consideration, or to schedule the matter for Historic Zoning Commission consideration at a later date.

No one requested to add any items.

Item 7:

Consideration of Alterations (Porch Addition, Ramp) at 701 W. Main St.; Shirley McGrew, Applicant.

Mr. Bryan stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the extension of a rear porch and the installation of a concrete walkway at 701 West Main Street. Ms. Rose stated subject property is a one-story folk Victorian-style home that is currently being used as office space. Mr. Bryan stated to comply with building code as well as the Americans with Disabilities Act, a handicap ramp must be installed to make the house ADA-accessible. Mr. Bryan stated the applicant is proposing to install a concrete walkway, 4 feet in width, from the designated handicap parking spot to connect to a proposed rear porch expansion, measuring 7 feet in length, along the rear elevation of the principal structure. Mr. Bryan stated the new deck is proposed to be constructed of cedar and match the existing rear porch. Mr. Bryan stated it is recommended that the Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions the proposed alterations to the porch and ramp with the following:

1. Safety railing design and material must be submitted to the Preservation Planner for review and approval in light of the applicable *Guidelines* prior to issuance of a building permit.
2. The application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a building permit. Any changes to approved plans must be returned to the Historic Zoning Commission for review and approval.

Mr. Hathaway moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve the alterations to the porch and ramp with staff's comments. Mr. Carson seconded the motion.

Ms. McGrew stated she had no comments to add.

Vice-Chairwoman Pearce requested to know if there were any citizens who wished to comment, and no requested to comment.

With the motion having been made and seconded, the motion passed 5-0.

Item 8:

Consideration of Alterations to Previously-Approved New Construction at 325 Fair Park Ct. (Lot 2); Scott Black, Applicant.

Ms. Rose stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the construction of a two-story single-family residence at 325 Fair Park Ct. (Lot 2). Ms. Rose stated the residence is proposed to be situated to front Fair Park Ct. and back against floodplain areas visible from Highway 96W. Ms. Rose stated the project was originally approved for issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness from the Historic Zoning Commission at its April 11, 2016 meeting. Ms. Rose stated the project was then approved for an administrative 6-month extension per COA Extension Policy effective until October 11, 2017. Ms. Rose stated one change is proposed to the previously-approved plan as related to lot size. Ms. Rose noted that with the exception of the enlarged front elevation drawing, all elevations have been drafted at a 1/8" scale. Ms. Rose stated the enlarged front elevation drawing is a 1/4" scale (see Exhibit 1). Ms. Rose stated that it is recommended that the Historic Zoning Commission approve the with conditions the proposed new construction with the following:

1. Any deviation from the overall height (28'-8" at highest point of front elevation and 31'-6" at highest point of rear elevation), foundation height, finished floor elevation, lot coverage, or siting of the structure as presented within this application, due to grading or otherwise, must be submitted to the Preservation Planner for review and approval prior to construction.
2. As a condition of approval, window, garage door, and plantation shutter specifications must be submitted to the Preservation Planner for review and approval in light of the *Guidelines* prior to issuance of a building permit.
3. Any issuance of a COA is contingent upon the City of Franklin's approval of the site plan revision and the final plat with the lot size as demonstrated within this application.
4. The application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a building permit. Any additional changes must be returned to the Preservation Planner or the Historic Zoning Commission for review and approval.
5. A scaled set of all elevations notating the following must be submitted to the Preservation Planner prior to issuance of a building permit:
 - a. Finished floor elevation;
 - b. Overall building height;
 - c. Foundation height with proposed/conceptual grading from front property line to foundation of house, and proposed/conceptual grading along the front façade of the house (if such information cannot be provided, foundation height details should be given for the largest and smallest foundation heights envisioned for the site); and
 - d. All approved building materials, including porch steps.

Mr. Black stated nothing in the plans are different than the previously-approved plan.

Vice-Chairwoman Pearce requested to know if there were any citizens who wished to comment, and no requested to comment.

Mr. Roberts moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #6101 for the new construction, in accordance with the *Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines* and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated December 11, 2017. Mr. Hathaway seconded the motion, and the motion passed 5-0.

Item 9:

Consideration of Alterations to Previously-Approved New Construction at 331 Fair Park Ct. (Lot 3); Scott Black, Applicant.

Ms. Rose stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the construction of a two-story single-family residence at 331 Fair Park Ct. (Lot 3). Ms. Rose stated the residence is proposed to be situated to front Fair Park Ct. and back against floodplain areas visible from Highway 96W. Ms. Rose stated the project was originally approved for issuance of a COA from the Historic Zoning Commission at its April 11, 2016 meeting. Ms. Rose stated the project was then approved for an administrative six-month extension per COA Extension Policy effective until October 11, 2017. Ms. Rose stated two changes are proposed to the previously-approved plan. Ms. Rose noted with the exception of the enlarged front elevation drawing, all elevations have been drafted at a 1/8" scale. Ms. Rose stated the enlarged front elevation drawing is a 1/4" scale (see Exhibit 1 for the original front elevation). Ms. Rose stated it is recommended that the Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions the proposed new construction with the following:

1. As condition of approval, the applicant must use the siding configuration represented by Exhibit 3, as the use of both lap siding and vertical board-and-batten siding on the front elevation is not consistent with the *Guidelines*. It is not a façade treatment found elsewhere within the Hincheyville Historic District. The *Guidelines* recommend that new construction be designed to be compatible in architectural features with adjacent structures and that it be consistent with the context of the surrounding neighborhood (p.66, #4, #27).
2. Any deviation from the overall height (31' at highest point of front elevation and 34' at highest point of rear elevation), foundation height, finished floor elevation, lot coverage, or siting of the structure as presented within this application, due to grading or otherwise, must be submitted to the Preservation Planner for review and approval prior to construction.
3. Window and garage door material specifications must be submitted to the Preservation Planner for review and approval in light of the *Guidelines* prior to issuance of a building permit.
4. Any issuance of a COA is contingent upon the City of Franklin's approval of the site plan revision and the final plat with the lot size as demonstrated within this application.

5. The application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a building permit. Any additional changes to HZC-approved plans must be returned to the HZC for review and approval.
6. A scaled set of all elevations notating the following must be submitted to the Preservation Planner prior to issuance of a building permit:
 - a. Finished floor elevation;
 - b. Overall building height;
 - c. Foundation height with proposed/conceptual grading from front property line to foundation of house, and proposed/conceptual grading along the front façade of the house
 - d. (if such information cannot be provided, foundation height details should be given for the largest and smallest foundation heights envisioned for the site); and
 - e. All approved building materials, including porch steps.

Mr. Black had no comments to add.

Vice-Chairwoman Pearce requested to know if there were any citizens who wished to comment, and no requested to comment.

Mr. Hathaway moved for approval as submitted with staff comments Project PL #6102. Mr. Carson seconded the motion, and the motion passed 5-0.

Item 10:

Consideration of Alterations to Previously-Approved New Construction at 332 Fair Park Ct. (Lot 4); Scott Black, Applicant.

Ms. Rose stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the construction of a two-story single-family residence at 332 Fair Park Ct. (Lot 4). Ms. Rose stated the project was originally approved for issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness from the Historic Zoning Commission at its April 11, 2016 meeting. Ms. Rose stated the project was then approved for an administrative 6-month extension per COA Extension Policy effective until October 11, 2017. Ms. Rose stated one change is proposed to the previously-approved plan as related to lot size. Ms. Rose noted that with the exception of the enlarged front elevation drawing, all elevations have been drafted at a 1/8" scale. The enlarged front elevation drawing is a 1/4" scale (see Exhibit 1). Please also note that the right and left side elevations are mislabeled as one another. Ms. Rose stated it is recommended that the Historic Zoning Commission approve the with conditions the proposed new construction with the following:

1. Any deviation from the overall height (27'-6"), foundation height, finished floor elevation, lot coverage, or siting of the structure as presented within this application, due to grading or otherwise, must be submitted to the Preservation Planner for review and approval prior to construction.
2. Window and garage door specifications must be submitted to the Preservation Planner for review and approval in light of the Guidelines prior to issuance of a building permit.

3. Any issuance of a COA is contingent upon the City of Franklin's approval of the site plan revision and the final plat with the lot size as demonstrated within this application.
4. The application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a building permit. Any additional changes must be returned to the Preservation Planner or the Historic Zoning Commission for review and approval.
5. A scaled set of all elevations notating the following must be submitted to the Preservation Planner prior to issuance of a building permit:
 - a. Finished floor elevation;
 - b. Overall building height;
 - c. Foundation height with proposed/conceptual grading from front property line to foundation of house, and proposed/conceptual grading along the front façade of the house (if such information cannot be provided, foundation height details should be given for the largest and smallest foundation heights envisioned for the site); and
 - d. All approved building materials, including porch steps.

Mr. Black had no comments to add.

Vice-Chairwoman Pearce requested to know if there were any citizens who wished to comment, and no requested to comment.

Mr. Roberts moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #6103 for the new construction, in accordance with the Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated December 11, 2017. Mr. Hathaway seconded the motion, and the motion passed 5-0.

Item 11:

Consideration of Alterations to Previously-Approved New Construction at 326 Fair Park Ct. (Lot 5); Scott Black, Applicant.

Ms. Rose stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the construction of a two-story single-family residence at 326 Fair Park Ct. (Lot 5). Ms. Rose stated the project was originally approved for issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness from the Historic Zoning Commission at its April 11, 2016 meeting. Ms. Rose stated the project was then approved for an administrative 6-month extension per COA Extension Policy effective until October 11, 2017. Ms. Rose stated one change is proposed to the previously-approved plan as related to lot size. Ms. Rose noted that with the exception of the enlarged front elevation drawing, all elevations have been drafted at a 1/8" scale. Ms. Rose stated the enlarged front elevation drawing is a 1/4" scale (see Exhibit 1). Ms. Rose stated the it is recommended that the Historic Zoning Commission approve the with conditions the proposed new construction with the following:

1. Any deviation from the overall height (29' to the highest point of the hipped roof and 27'-6" to the highest point of the front gable), foundation height, finished floor elevation,

lot coverage, or siting of the structure as presented within this application, due to grading or otherwise, must be submitted to the Preservation Planner for review and approval prior to construction.

2. Window and garage door specifications must be submitted to the Preservation Planner for review and approval in light of the Guidelines prior to issuance of a building permit.
3. Any issuance of a COA is contingent upon the City of Franklin's approval of the site plan revision and the final plat with the lot size as demonstrated within this application.
4. The application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a building permit. Any additional changes to approved plans must be returned to the Historic Zoning Commission for review and approval.
5. A scaled set of all elevations notating the following must be submitted to the Preservation Planner prior to issuance of a building permit:
 - a. Finished floor elevation;
 - b. Overall building height;
 - c. Foundation height with proposed/conceptual grading from front property line to foundation of house, and proposed/conceptual grading along the front façade of the house (if such information cannot be provided, foundation height details should be given for the largest and smallest foundation heights envisioned for the site); and
 - d. All approved building materials, including porch steps.

Mr. Black had no comments to add.

Vice-Chairwoman Pearce requested to know if there were any citizens who wished to comment, and no requested to comment.

Mr. Carson moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #6104 for the new construction, in accordance with the Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated December 11, 2017. Mr. Roberts seconded the motion, and the motion passed 5-0.

Item 12:

Consideration of Alterations to Previously-Approved New Construction at 320 Fair Park Ct. (Lot 6); Scott Black, Applicant.

Ms. Rose stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the construction of a two-story single-family residence at 320 Fair Park Ct. (Lot 6). Ms. Rose stated the project was originally approved for issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness from the Historic Zoning Commission at its April 11, 2016 meeting. Ms. Rose stated the project was then approved for an administrative 6-month extension per COA Extension Policy effective until October 11, 2017. Ms. Rose stated one change is proposed to the previously-approved plan as related to lot size. Ms. Rose stated it is recommended that the Historic Zoning Commission approve the with conditions the proposed new construction with the following:

1. As a condition of approval, the entrance detail must be altered and returned to the Preservation Planner for review and approval prior to issuance of a building permit.
2. Any deviation from the overall height (approximately 28'-8" at the highest point of the front gable and approximately 26'-6" to the highest point of the rear gable), foundation height, finished floor elevation, lot coverage, or siting of the structure as presented within this application, due to grading or otherwise, must be submitted to the Preservation Planner for review and approval prior to construction.
3. Window and garage door specifications must be submitted to the Preservation Planner for review and approval in light of the Guidelines prior to issuance of a building permit.
4. Any issuance of a COA is contingent upon the City of Franklin's approval of the site plan revision and the final plat with the lot size as demonstrated within this application.
5. The application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a building permit. Any additional changes to approved plans must be returned to the Historic Zoning Commission for review and approval.
6. A scaled set of all elevations notating the following must be submitted to the Preservation Planner prior to issuance of a building permit:
 - a. Finished floor elevation;
 - b. Overall building height;
 - c. Foundation height with proposed/conceptual grading from front property line to foundation of house, and proposed/conceptual grading along the front façade of the house (if such information cannot be provided, foundation height details should be given for the largest and smallest foundation heights envisioned for the site); and
 - d. All approved building materials, including porch steps.

Mr. Black stated they would do whatever was needed to be done to meet the conditions.

Vice-Chairwoman Pearce requested to know if there were any citizens who wished to comment, and no requested to comment.

Mr. Thompson moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #6105 for the new construction, in accordance with the Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated December 11, 2017. Mr. Hathaway seconded the motion, and the motion passed 5-0.

Item 13:

Recommendation Request: Consideration of Submittal of Updated Nomination for the Franklin Historic District to the National Register of Historic Places (No Boundary Increase).

Ms. Rose stated that the City requests the Commission consider the attached nomination for the Franklin Historic District to be submitted to update the National Register Historic District documentation. Ms. Rose stated this process is part of a grant received from the Tennessee Historic Commission. Ms. Rose stated the purpose of the update was to resurvey all the

properties to identify all those that are no longer existing and re-assess properties are contributing or noncontributing to the district's character. Ms. Rose stated that this evaluation is mainly for primary principal structures, but she did ask the consultant to consider outbuildings as well. Ms. Rose stated no boundary extensions is part of this update. Ms. Rose explained the survey listed 235 contributing structures and 60 non-contributing structures. Ms. Rose stated the update also contains 25 contributing outbuildings and 50 non-contributing outbuildings. Ms. Rose stated only 10 of the primary resources were constructed between 1949 and 1967. Ms. Rose stated the Forrest Manor apartment building, located at 300 4th Ave. S. at corner of S. Margin St. and 4th Ave. S., has been suggested by the consultant to be added to the listing as a contributing structure. Ms. Rose stated that the Dan German house is recommended to be revised as a contributing structure as well. Ms. Rose explained why this commission needed to send the recommendation.

Ms. Pearce requested to know what the original numbers were.

Ms. Rose stated the district has lost about 30 structures.

Ms. Pearce stated that she would like a list of the lost properties and structures and a list of all the non-protected structures that were lost.

Ms. Rose stated she would get that to her.

Vice-Chairwoman Pearce requested to know if anyone in the audience would like to speak, and no one requested to speak.

Vice-Chairwoman Pearce requested to know if there was anyone who wanted to make a motion for this request.

Mr. Hathaway moved to give a favorable recommendation for the consultant's recommendations for the updating of the Franklin Historic District to the National Register of Historic Places. Mr. Carson seconded the motion.

Mr. Hathaway stated he has a question on what triggered the consultant's recommendation for Forrest Manor Apartments.

Vice-Chairwoman Pearce stated she feels it is an intrusion due to the building being out of scale with everything around it.

Ms. Rose stated the commission can recommend the removal of this property as a contributing structure and explained.

Discussion ensued.

Mr. Hathaway moved to amend his motion to remove the consultant's recommendation of adding Forrest Manor Apartments as a contributing structure. Mr. Carson seconded the motion, and the motion passed 5-0.

With the main motion having been made and amended, the motion passed 5-0.

Item 14:

Non-agenda emergency items accepted by the commission for consideration.

No non-agenda emergency items.

Mr. Thompson stated the City should seek extending the historic district.

Item 15:

Adjourn.

With no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 6:01 p.m.

Acting Secretary