

**FRANKLIN HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION  
MINUTES  
November 13, 2017**

The Franklin Historic Zoning Commission held a special meeting on Monday, November 13, 2017, at 5:00 pm in the City Hall Boardroom at 109 Third Avenue South.

Members Present: Mary Pearce  
Mike Hathaway  
Susan Besser  
Mel Thompson  
Jeff Carson  
Ken Scalf  
Jim Roberts  
Rusty Womack  
Lisa Marquardt

Staff Present: Amanda Rose, Planning & Sustainability Department  
Joey Bryan, Planning & Sustainability Department  
James Svoboda, Planning & Sustainability Department  
Tiffani Pope, Law Department  
Randall Tosh, BNS Department

**Item 1:  
Call to Order**

Chairwoman Besser called to order the November 13, 2017, Historic Zoning Commission meeting at 5:00 p.m.

**Item 2 & Item 3:  
Minutes: October 9, 2017 and Minutes: October 23, 2017**

Ms. Pearce moved to approve the October 9<sup>th</sup>, 2017, with correction to typos. Mr. Thompson seconded the motion and the motion passed 8-0.

**Item 4:  
Staff Announcements.**

Ms. Rose stated the next Design Review meeting will be November 20<sup>th</sup>, 2017.

**Item 5:  
Consideration of Requests to place non-agenda emergency items on the agenda.**

No non-agenda items.

**Item 6:  
Citizens Comments on Items Not on the Agenda**

**Open for Franklin citizens to be heard on items not included on this Agenda. As provided by law, the Historic Zoning Commission shall make no decisions or consideration of action of citizen comments, except to refer the matter to the Planning Director for administrative consideration, or to schedule the matter for Historic Zoning Commission consideration at a later date.**

No one requested to speak.

**Item 7:**

**Consideration of Signage at Parcel 078C-D00201 (parking lot behind 118 3<sup>rd</sup> Ave. N. & 126 3<sup>rd</sup> Ave. N.); Keith Moorman, Applicant.**

Mr. Bryan stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the installation of three freestanding convenience signs in the parking lot at Parcel: 078C-D00201 located behind 118 and 126 3<sup>rd</sup> Avenue North. Mr. Bryan stated the signs are proposed to be installed evenly spaced apart on the existing fence along the eastern property line. Mr. Bryan stated Staff has classified these instructional signs as “Freestanding Convenience” signs in accordance with Section 5.12.11(6) of the Franklin Zoning Ordinance. Mr. Bryan stated the Historic District Design Guidelines are only specific to signage within residential and nonresidential areas and do not give guidance to freestanding convenience signage. Mr. Bryan stated in accordance with Section 5.12.3 of the Zoning Ordinance, where the Guidelines and Zoning Ordinance conflict as they relate to signage, the Guidelines shall take precedence within the Historic Preservation Overlay. Mr. Bryan stated where the Guidelines are silent, the Zoning Ordinance shall govern. Mr. Bryan stated because the Guidelines are silent on freestanding convenience signage, the Zoning Ordinance shall be applied. Mr. Bryan stated it is recommended that the Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions the proposed freestanding convenience signage with the following:

1. Since the *Guidelines* do not speak directly to signage of the proposed type, the Zoning Ordinance shall be applied. The proposal appears to be consistent with the regulations of the Zoning Ordinance. Any additional freestanding signage request cannot be administratively reviewed and must come before the Historic Zoning Commission for review and approval.
2. As a condition of approval, any future signage request for this lot is not eligible for administrative review and must come before the Historic Zoning Commission for review and approval.
3. The application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a sign permit. Any changes to approved plans must be returned to the Historic Zoning Commission for review and approval.

Mr. Moorman stated Mr. Bryan did a great job explaining what we have requested.

Chairwoman Besser requested to know if citizens wished to comment, and no one did.

Ms. Marquardt moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #6549 for the proposed freestanding convenience signage with staff’s comments, in accordance with the Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated November 13, 2017. Mr. Scalf seconded the motion.

Mr. Roberts requested to know how many signs have already been approved.

Mr. Moorman stated three.

Ms. Pearce questioned the height of the sign and whether it needed to be so tall.

Mr. Moorman stated the height could be adjusted if needed.

Ms. Pearce stated paid parking is coming to downtown and that the paid parking does not need to be more eye-catching than the historic built environment. Ms. Pearce stated it should be calmed down visually as much as possible.

After some discussion, Mr. Hathaway moved to amend the motion to include that the top of the signs not be higher than the fence on which they are being mounted. Mr. Thompson seconded the motion.

Ms. Pearce stated a “not to exceed” phrase should be added to the motion.

The amendment passed 8-1, with Mr. Roberts voting no.

Mr. Roberts requested clarification on the classification of the proposal as “freestanding convenience signage” in spite of it being attached to the fence.

Mr. Bryan stated that it is classified as a freestanding sign.

Ms. Pearce moved to amend the motion that the signs be true freestanding with a black square wrought-iron post with a finial on top, the paint be a satin finish, and that the signs return to staff for approval. Mr. Thompson seconded the motion, and the amendment passed 8-1, with Mr. Roberts voting no.

Further discussion ensued on height.

With the main motion having been made and amended twice, the motion passed 9-0.

#### **Item 8:**

#### **Consideration of Demolition (Accessory) at 1205 Columbia Ave.; Battle of Franklin Trust, Applicant.**

Mr. Bryan stated the applicants are requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the demolition of an accessory structure located at the rear of the property at 1205 Columbia Ave. Mr. Bryan stated the subject structure is a utility shed with storage areas and a two-bay carport for vehicles. Mr. Bryan stated it is a frame construction building that was built circa, 1954, with a board-and-batten exterior and standing seam metal roof. Mr. Bryan stated the applicant has requested the demolition based on the loss of historical integrity criterion as outlined in the *Historic District Design Guidelines*. Mr. Bryan stated it is recommended that the Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions the proposed demolition of the accessory structure with the following:

1. Based on the application materials and a site visit by City staff, it is determined that the accessory structure lacks historical integrity. Because of this, its removal would not adversely affect the corridor’s historic character. The accessory structure must be satisfactorily photographed inside and out and submitted to the Planning & Sustainability Department for Commission records prior to its removal.
2. The application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a demolition permit. Any changes to the approved plans must be returned to the HZC for review and approval.

Mr. Gary Rosenthal stated that he was here to represent the item. Mr. Rosenthal explained their view is to develop this area into a historical setting of the 19<sup>th</sup> century. Mr. Rosenthal pointed out locations on the projected pictures. Mr. Rosenthal stated the grounds are historical and explained. Mr. Rosenthal stated it

is important to interpret that facility and open space in the same way as we are interpreting the Carter Hill Park properties.

Chairwoman Besser requested to know if citizens wished to comment, and no one did.

Mr. Roberts moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #6569 for the proposed demolition of the accessory structure with staff's comments, in accordance with the Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated November 13, 2017. Mr. Hathaway seconded the motion.

Ms. Pearce moved to amend the motion to include that staff inspect the building internally to evaluate if any portion dates to pre-1950. Ms. Marquardt seconded the motion, and the motion passed 9-0.

With the main motion having been made and amended, the motion passed 9-0.

### **Item 9:**

#### **Consideration of Alterations (Front Façade Rehabilitation) at 115 2<sup>nd</sup> Ave. S.; James T. Patterson, Applicant.**

Ms. Rose stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for a series of repairs to the front façade. Ms. Rose stated the alterations are proposed to ensure the structural integrity of the building. Ms. Rose stated the Hiram Lodge, constructed in 1823, is recognized as a National Historic Landmark. Ms. Rose stated the applicant appeared before the Design Review Committee to discuss the proposal at its October 16, 2017 meeting. Ms. Rose stated it is recommended that the Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions the proposed front façade rehabilitation with the following:

1. Historic windows must be preserved and maintained (p.129). Any new windows must be wood in material and have historic profile and dimension consistent with that of the original windows. The window specifications must be approved by the Preservation Planner or the Historic Zoning Commission prior to issuance of a building permit.
2. The applicant shall reuse existing stone and historic brick where possible for reconstruction and repairs, per *Guidelines*. Any new brick must match the color, texture, and profile of the original. Masonry cleaning should be done as gently as possible and must include sandblasting or other abrasive cleaning methods. Repointing must match the original in composition and appearance (p.113, #1-5).
3. The application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a building permit. Any additional changes to the approved plans must be returned to the Historic Zoning Commission for review and approval.

Mr. Patterson introduced the members from his team that were present and stated Ms. Belinda Stewart, the project architect, would answer any questions.

Ms. Stewart gave a recap of the proposed plan.

Chairwoman Besser requested to know if citizens wished to comment, and no one did.

Ms. Pearce moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #6570 for the front façade rehabilitation with staff's comments, in accordance with the Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated November 13, 2017. Mr. Thompson seconded the motion.

Ms. Marquardt requested to know if signage has been placed on the site letting the public know what is happening at the site.

Ms. Stewart stated not yet but that they were planning on addressing the work with signage.

The motion passed 9-0.

#### **Item 10:**

#### **Consideration of Addition (Principal) & New Construction (Accessory) at 1059 W. Main St.; Tim & Alison Turner, Applicants.**

Mr. Thompson recused himself from this item.

Ms. Rose stated the applicants are requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the construction of a 1-1/2-story detached accessory structure at the rear of the property located at 1059 W. Main St. Ms. Rose stated the applicants are also requesting approval for the construction of a 565-sq. ft. rear addition to the principal structure. Ms. Rose stated the applicant appeared before the Design Review Committee to discuss the proposal at its October 16, 2017 meeting. Ms. Rose stated it is recommended that the Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions the proposed principal structure addition with the following:

1. The windows must have historic profile and dimension and consist of either wood or a composite material with the appearance of wood. The window specifications must be approved by the Preservation Planner or the Historic Zoning Commission prior to issuance of a building permit.
2. While standing seam is appropriate, the use of faux standing seam metal roofing may be not entirely consistent with the *Guidelines* (p.82, #7). As a condition of approval, the applicant must use standing seam metal or otherwise provide specifications to the Historic Zoning Commission for its consideration and approval.
3. The application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a building permit. Any additional changes to the approved plans must be returned to the Historic Zoning Commission for review and approval, and a scaled set of all elevations notating the following must be submitted to the Preservation Planner prior to issuance of a building permit:
  - all approved building materials, including foundation material and lap reveal; and
  - the overall height of the addition areas in relation to its existing residence's overall height and eave heights.

Ms. Rose stated it is recommended that the Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions the construction of the proposed accessory structure with the following:

1. Dormers can be supported by the *Guidelines* if scaled appropriately “to relate to the style and proportion of windows on the principal structure” and “set back a minimum of two feet from the exterior wall” (p.64, #5). It does not appear that all the proposed dormers on the accessory structure are recessed two feet off their respective walls to meet this recommendation. The applicant should clarify if the proposed dormers meet this *Guidelines* recommendation, and if the dormer designs are not consistent with the *Guidelines*, the designs should be revised to do so.
2. While standing seam is appropriate, the use of faux standing seam metal roofing may be not entirely consistent with the *Guidelines* (p.82, #7). As a condition of approval, the applicant must use standing seam metal or otherwise provide specifications to the Historic Zoning Commission for its consideration and approval.
3. The windows must have historic profile and dimension and consist of either wood or a composite material with the appearance of wood. The window specifications must be approved by the Preservation Planner or the Historic Zoning Commission prior to issuance of a building permit.

4. The application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a building permit. The applicant should ensure that the proposed use of the accessory structure meets the regulations of the Zoning Ordinance since the accessory structure, as currently designed, may not meet the requirements of the Accessory Dwellings ordinance.
5. Any proposed changes to the approved plans must be returned to the Historic Zoning Commission for review and approval, and a scaled set of all elevations notating the following must be submitted to the Preservation Planner prior to issuance of a building permit:
  - all approved building materials, including foundation material and lap reveal; and
  - the overall height of the new construction in relation to its existing residence's overall height and eave heights.

Mr. Turner stated Ms. Rose did a great job explaining what they wanted to do and that he appreciated the comments from DRC.

Chairwoman Besser requested to know if citizens wished to comment, and no one did.

Ms. Pearce moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #6571 for the rear addition with staff's comments, in accordance with the Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated November 13, 2017. Mr. Womack seconded the motion, and the motion passed 8-0.

Mr. Scalf moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #6571 for the construction of the accessory structure with staff's comments, in accordance with the Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated November 13, 2017. Mr. Womack seconded the motion.

Ms. Pearce requested to know how many square feet are in the accessory structure and bottom floor of house.

Ms. Rose stated that the proposed footprints show an 1,836-square foot footprint for the accessory structure and a 3,194-square foot footprint for the principal structure.

Mr. Womack requested more information on the faux standing seam roof.

Mr. Turner stated they would get a sample to Ms. Rose.

Discussion ensued regarding staff's previous comments, with pictures projected for clarity.

The motion for the accessory structure passed 8-0.

**Item 11:  
Other Business.**

Discussion on signs.

**Item 12:  
Adjourn.**

With no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 6:18 p.m.

DRAFT