

**FRANKLIN HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION  
MINUTES  
September 11, 2017**

The Franklin Historic Zoning Commission held its regular scheduled meeting on Monday, September 11, 2017, at 5:00 pm in the City Hall Boardroom at 109 Third Avenue South.

Members Present: Mary Pearce  
Lisa Marquardt  
Mike Hathaway  
Susan Besser  
Mel Thompson  
Jeff Carson

Staff Present: Amanda Rose, Planning & Sustainability Department  
Joey Bryan, Planning & Sustainability Department  
Randall Tosh, BNS Department

**Item 1:  
Call to Order**

Chairwoman Besser called to order the September 11, 2017, Historic Zoning Commission meeting at 5:02 p.m.

**Item 2:  
Minutes: August 14, 2017**

Mr. Hathaway moved for approval of the August 14, 2017, minutes. Ms. Marquardt seconded the motion, and the motion passed 6-0.

**Item 3:  
Staff Announcements.**

Ms. Rose stated the next Design Review Committee will take place next Monday, September 18, 2017.

**Item 4:  
Consideration of Requests to place non-agenda emergency items on the agenda.**

No non-agenda items.

**Item 5:  
Citizens Comments on Items Not on the Agenda open for Franklin citizens to be heard on items not included on this Agenda. As provided by law, the Historic Zoning Commission shall make no decisions or consideration of action of citizen comments, except to refer the matter to the Planning Director for administrative consideration, or to schedule the matter for Historic Zoning Commission consideration at a later date.**

**Item 6:  
Consideration of Alterations (Rear Window) at 226 5<sup>th</sup> Ave. S.; Kevin Coffey, Applicant.**

Ms. Rose stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the replacement of a rear elevation window with paired French doors. Ms. Rose stated the item appeared before the Historic Zoning Commission at its August 14, 2017 meeting, and the HZC deferred the item for more information. Ms. Rose stated it is recommended that the Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions the proposed rear elevation window removal and door placement with the following:

1. Door specifications must be submitted to the Preservation Planner for review and approval prior to issuance of a COA.
2. The application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a building permit. Any additional or proposed changes to the approved plans must be returned to the Preservation Planner and/or the Historic Zoning Commission for review and approval.

Ms. Laurie Coderre stated that she agrees with Ms. Rose's comments.

Chairwoman Besser requested to know if any citizens wished to comment and no one requested to comment.

Mr. Hathaway moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #6503 for the proposed rear elevation window removal and door placement with staff's comments. Ms. Pearce seconded the motion and the motion passed 6-0.

#### **Item 7:**

#### **Consideration of Landscaping/Site Features at 136 3<sup>rd</sup> Ave. S.; Joseph Haworth, Applicant.**

Mr. Bryan stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for a series of alterations to the landscaping and installation of site features at 136 3<sup>rd</sup> Avenue South. Mr. Bryan stated the proposed plan requests the installation of concrete walkways, a concrete patio along Church Street, and two brick patio areas. Mr. Bryan stated the brick patio area at the main entry of the building is proposed to feature an inlay design in the shape of a cross that is also to be constructed of brick. Mr. Bryan stated the applicant appeared before the Design Review Committee at its May 15<sup>th</sup> and July 17<sup>th</sup>, 2017 meetings to discuss the project. Mr. Bryan stated the application materials reference the installation of a new sign as part of the overall landscape plan and includes an example of what type of sign would be requested. No sign design or specifications has been submitted at this time.

Mr. Bryan stated it is recommended that the Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions the proposed alterations to the landscaping and site features with the following:

1. No request for signage is being considered at this time. As a condition of approval, the applicant must return to Staff with a separate application for consideration of new signage.
2. As a condition of approval, a sample of the selected brick must be submitted to the Preservation Planner for review and approval prior to issuance of a building permit.
3. The application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department. Any changes to the approved plans must be returned to the HZC for review and approval.

Mr. Haworth stated that he agreed with staff's comment.

Chairwoman Besser requested to know if any citizens wished to comment and no one requested to comment.

Mr. Hathaway moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #6527 for the proposed alterations to the landscaping and site features in accordance. Ms. Marquardt seconded the motion.

Mr. Hathaway requested to know if any of the signage was included in this motion.

Mr. Bryan stated no, that would be handled at a later date.

Mr. Thompson requested to know if the inlay on the front was all brick.

Mr. Haworth stated it is planned to be all brick.

Ms. Pearce stated her concern was coming from a previous site where they did a big concrete and was very shocking. Ms. Pearce stated maybe it should be tinted or scored to soften the concrete.

Ms. Pearce moved to amend the motion to include that the 19ft.by 45ft. side terrace with the brick edge come back to staff to review and have applicant score terrace and have it fit in with the character of downtown Franklin. Mr. Hathaway seconded the motion and the motion passed 6-0.

With the main motion, having been made and seconded the motion passed 6-0.

#### **Item 8:**

#### **Consideration of Partial Demolition & Alterations (Accessory) at 232 3<sup>rd</sup> Ave. N.; Ron Berryessa, Applicant.**

Ms. Rose stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the partial demolition of the accessory structure, specifically through the removal of the right-side shed area walls and roof (amounting to approximately 78 sq. ft.) to allow a portion of the enclosed building to function as a partial open-air building. Ms. Rose stated applicant is also requesting to remove two existing retaining walls and to replace them with 6x6 timber-style walls. Ms. Rose stated proposed landscape improvements include the introduction of concrete and gravel walking paths in the rear yard. Ms. Rose stated applicant appeared before the DRC to discuss the proposal at its March 20, 2017 meeting. Ms. Rose stated it is recommended that the Historic Zoning Commission defer review of the proposed accessory structure partial demolition and retaining wall alterations with the following:

1. The applicant has failed to provide sufficient documentation to substantiate any one or more of the four criteria by which the Historic Zoning Commission may consider demolition (p.102, #2). Without the inclusion of the supplementary materials cited with the demolition criteria, a determination cannot be made.
2. Additional information is requested to understand the location and appearance of the existing retaining walls so as to determine if the proposed alteration is in keeping with the intent of the applicable *Guidelines*.
3. If issued a COA, all approved exterior demolition is limited to what is indicated on the application plan set. Any demolition that may compromise the exterior materials, details, or forms of the existing residence must be reviewed and approved by the Historic Zoning Commission prior to work proceeding.
4. If issued a COA, the garage door specifications must be submitted to the Preservation Planner for consideration in light of the *Guidelines* prior to issuance of a building permit.
5. If issued a COA, the application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a building permit. The applicant is recommended to contact the Building & Neighborhood Services Department to discuss the permissibility of the proposed sitting area structures and retaining walls, as additional accessory structure and

floodplain regulations may apply. Any additional changes to the approved plans must be returned to the Historic Zoning Commission for review and approval.

Ms. Rose stated it is recommended that the Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions of the proposed rear yard walkways with the following:

1. The application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a building permit. The applicant is recommended to contact the Building & Neighborhood Services Department to discuss the permissibility of the proposed sitting area structures and walkways, as additional accessory structure and floodplain regulations may apply. Any additional changes to the approved plans must be returned to the Historic Zoning Commission for review and approval.
2. The items noted as “future items” within the application (additional parking pad, fencing) require additional information for consideration in light of the applicable *Guidelines*. A separate application is required to be submitted in order for the Historic Zoning Commission to determine eligibility for issuance of COAs for these items.

Mr. Berryessa requested the front of the garage be projected on the screen. Mr. Berryessa stated the section to the left of the pedestrian door where the gable roof line and shed line would be removed. Mr. Berryessa stated the reason for not having a full set up plans is due to the limited budget. Mr. Berryessa stated the DRC recommended to keep as much of the building as possible. Mr. Berryessa stated due to the flood plain they lost the storage building. Mr. Berryessa stated they are trying to combine the two so only a small part of the garage structure will have to be removed. Mr. Berryessa stated it would never be used as a garage just as storage place. Mr. Berryessa stated they wanted to create some nice open space for parents and children and therapists. Mr. Berryessa pointed out several features on the projected photograph and stated they would make it look nice. Mr. Berryessa stated he would like to propose to meet the commission as far as he can, but still provide extra space for the client.

Chairwoman Besser requested to know if any citizens wished to comment and no one requested to comment.

Mr. Berryessa passed out a photograph.

Ms. Marquardt moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #6528 for the partial demolition of the accessory structure and the replacement of the two rear retaining walls with staff's comments. Mr. Hathaway seconded the motion.

Mr. Hathaway amended the motion to include this is just the approval of the demolition and not approval of the new construction.

Mr. Thompson questioned the motion.

Mr. Hathaway explained.

The previous motion by Ms. Marquardt was withdrawn.

Ms. Pearce moved to approve the partial demolition only. Ms. Marquardt seconded the motion.

Mr. Hathaway amended the motion to include that the final plans are submitted at a later date. Ms. Pearce seconded the motion. The amendment passed 6-0

With the main motion, having been made and amended the motion passed 6-0.

Mr. Berryessa stated the purpose is to take big rocks away from the kids and stated a stacked stone wall would not be safe for the kids and explained.

Ms. Marquardt moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve the retaining walls as submitted in accordance with the *Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines*. Mr. Thompson seconded the motion and the motion passed 6-0.

Mr. Berryessa stated the owners want to create like a peaceful space for therapy.

Mr. Thompson moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #6528 for the installation of the rear yard walkways with staff's comments, in accordance with the *Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines* and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated September 11, 2017. Mr. Hathaway seconded the motion

Comments were made on the sand pit.

With the main motion, having been made and seconded the motion passed 6-0.

**Item 9:**

**Non-agenda emergency items accepted by the commission for consideration.**

Ms. Pearce reminded everyone about the Tennessee Preservation Trust conference, September 20th thru the 22<sup>nd</sup>.

Ms. Rose stated Mr. Thompson will be rolling off the commission due to moving out of Franklin and thanked him for his service to the Historic Zoning Commission. Ms. Rose stated there is a training session on October 23rd.

**Item 10:**

**Adjourn.**

With no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:54 p.m.

---

**Acting Secretary**