

**FRANKLIN HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION  
MINUTES  
November 14, 2016**

The Franklin Historic Zoning Commission held its regular scheduled meeting on Monday, November 14, 2016, at 5:00 pm in the City Hall Boardroom at 109 Third Avenue South.

Members Present: Susan Besser  
Jeff Carson  
Mike Hathaway  
Lisa Marquardt  
Jim Roberts  
Rusty Womack  
Mary Pearce  
Mel Thompson  
Trisha Nesbitt

Staff Present: Amanda Rose, Planning & Sustainability Department  
Joey Bryan, Planning & Sustainability Department  
Emily Hunter, Planning & Sustainability Department  
Kristen Corn, Law Department  
Randall Tosh, BNS Department

**Item 1:**

Chairwoman Besser called to order the November 14, 2016, Historic Zoning Commission meeting at 5:00 p.m.

**Item 2:**

**Minutes: October 10, 2016**

Mr. Roberts stated he was not present at the October meeting.

Mr. Hathaway moved to approve the minutes of October 2016 with the correction of removing Mr. Roberts from the attendance list. Ms. Nesbitt seconded the motion and the motion was approved 9-0.

**Item 3:**

**Announcements.**

Ms. Pearce stated she has received three phone calls stating the lights on the square are too bright and need to be corrected.

Ms. Rose stated she got a similar request and will contact the Streets Department to see how it can be corrected. Ms. Rose stated DRC is next Monday, November 21, and will be in the City Hall Training Room.

**Item 4:****Consideration of Requests to place non-agenda emergency items on the agenda.**

Chairwoman Besser requested to know if there any non-agenda items and there were none.

**Item 5:****Citizens Comments on Items Not on the Agenda**

**Open for Franklin citizens to be heard on items not included on this Agenda. As provided by law, the Historic Zoning Commission shall make no decisions or consideration of action of citizen comments, except to refer the matter to the Planning Director for administrative consideration, or to schedule the matter for Historic Zoning Commission consideration at a later date.**

No one requested to speak.

**Item 6:****Consideration of Alterations (Chimney, Windows) at 224 3<sup>rd</sup> Ave. S.; Rob Tallman, Applicant.**

Mr. Bryan stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the alterations to the rear elevation of the garage addition at 224 3<sup>rd</sup> Ave S. Mr. Bryan stated the applicant is requesting to add a chimney to the rear wall of a non-original portion of the home and alter the window configuration by removing the Palladian-style window and adding two windows to flank the proposed chimney. Mr. Bryan stated the applicant appeared before the Design Review Committee (DRC) to discuss the proposal at its October 17, 2016 meeting. Mr. Bryan stated it is recommended that the Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions the construction of the chimney and window alterations with the following:

1. The proposed brick must match the existing brick. A sample of the brick must be submitted to the Preservation Planner for review and approval prior to issuance of a building permit.
2. All windows must be wood in material and of a historically appropriate profile and dimension. Window specifications must be submitted to the Preservation Planner for review and approval prior to issuance of a building permit.
3. The application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a building permit. Any additional changes and/or proposed changes to HZC-approved plans must be returned to the HZC for review and approval.

Mr. Tallman stated he didn't have anything to add.

Chairwoman Besser requested to know if any citizens would like to speak on this item and no one did.

Ms. Pearce moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #6291 for the proposed chimney and window alterations with staff's comments, in accordance with the *Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines* and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated November 14, 2016. Ms. Pearce stated the applicant was very responsive to DRC comments. Mr. Roberts seconded the motion.

Mr. Hathaway moved to amend the motion to include the break in the chimney occur underneath the eave on both sides tight against the eave and not below the eave by six or eight inches and pull the windows in toward the center of the chimney as much as feasible with the design. Mr. Thompson seconded the motion and the motion to amend the main motion passed 9-0.

With the main motion, having been made and amended the motion passed and motion carried 9-0.

**Item 7:**

**Consideration of New Construction at 1023 Benelli Park Ct.; Preston Shea, Applicant.**

Ms. Rose stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the construction of a 1 ½-story single family residence with attached two-bay garage at 1023 Benelli Park Ct. (Lot 6). Ms. Rose stated the applicant appeared before the Design Review Committee (DRC) to discuss the proposal at its October 17, 2016 meeting. Ms. Rose stated it is recommended that the Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions the proposed new construction of the principal structure with attached garage with the following:

1. The total building coverage on the lot is approximately **36.9 percent**, which is not entirely consistent with the *Guidelines*. The *Guidelines* recommend that maximum building coverage not exceed 35% in specified residential zoning districts (including R-3, the zoning of this particular lot), as measured by building footprint.
  - A. Staff recommends that the applicants modify the footprint of the proposed building to meet the recommendation of the *Guidelines* then return to the Preservation Planner for review and approval prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
2. All windows must be wood and consist of a historic profile and dimension, in accordance with the *Guidelines*. Window and garage door specifications must be submitted to the Preservation Planner for review and approval prior to issuance of a building permit.
3. Any deviation from the overall height proposed (31'-9"), foundation height, or finished floor elevation as presented within this application, due to grading or otherwise, must be submitted to the Preservation Planner for review and approval prior to construction.
4. The application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a building permit. Any proposed changes to the approved plans must be returned to the HZC for review and approval. Foundation height surveys may be required at the time of building permit review to ensure compatibility with the height and massing conditions set forth within the project's corresponding Certificate of Appropriateness.

Mr. Shea stated he was mostly on board with Staff's comments with exception of the lot coverage. Mr. Shea stated at DRC the house was a little larger, but they have taken it down a percentage and matches the percentage on the house next door and visually this will be the same size as the houses on the block. Mr. Shea stated the way it is drawn may make it appear a little short and he would ask to get a motion to approve either with 31.9 as documented with up 3ft. up to the adjacent ridge to give a flexibility.

Chairwoman Besser requested to know if any citizens would like to speak on this item and no one did.

Mr. Hathaway moved to approve Benelli Park lot number 6 with staff comments except for we will allow 36% lot coverage considering it is in reason with the guidelines and allow for the 3-ft. ridgeline. Mr. Womack seconded the motion.

Discussion ensued on the breezeway connector, Lot 5 and photos of the property.

With the motion, having been made and seconded the motion passed 9-0.

**Item 8:**

**Consideration of New Construction (Canopy) & Alterations (Entrance) at 611 W. Main St.; Bryan Richter, Applicant.**

Ms. Rose stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the construction of a structural entrance canopy at the W. Main St. elevation of the Williamson County Archives building at 611 W. Main St. Ms. Rose stated the purpose of the construction is to create a new, accessible entrance to the county building. Ms. Rose stated the proposal involves the modification of an existing aluminum windows/door set to allow for the construction of brick veneer screen walls on either side of the modified entrance, as well as the construction of a flat aluminum walkway cover to be supported by brick veneer posts. Ms. Rose stated the modification to the windows/door set is proposed to take place within the same fenestration opening. Ms. Rose stated it is recommended that the Historic Zoning Commission approve the proposed canopy construction and modification to the windows and door with the following:

1. The application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a building permit, and any changes to approved plans must be returned to the Historic Zoning Commission for review and approval.

Mr. Richter stated that he felt Ms. Rose explained everything sufficiently.

Chairwoman Besser requested to know if any citizens would like to speak on this item and no one did.

Mr. Roberts moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #6294 for the construction of the canopy and the modification to the windows and door with staff's comments, in accordance with the *Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines* and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated November 14, 2016. Mr. Thompson seconded the motion.

Chairwoman Besser requested the elevation showing the front of the building be projected larger.

Ms. Marquardt stated the renderings are not very clear of what this is going to look like.

Mr. Richter stated he brought some pictures to show everyone examples of canopies that already exist on Main Street.

Mr. Hathaway requested to know if this came to DRC.

Ms. Rose stated no.

Ms. Pearce suggested to scale down the posts in size and material due to existing structures already looking like the proposed design.

Mr. Richter stated they would eliminate the masonry from the posts.

After some discussion, Mr. Thompson moved to amend the motion to include the wing walls be glass, remove masonry from columns and consider having signage on canopy. Ms. Pearce seconded the amendment and the amendment passed 7-2 with Mr. Womack and Mr. Carson voting no.

Ms. Pearce moved to amend the motion to include that signage come back to staff and any other changes come back to staff for review. Mr. Hathaway seconded the amendment and the motion passed 9-0.

With the main motion, having been made and amended the motion passed 9-0.

Mr. Hathaway recused himself from the next item.

**Item 9:**

**Consideration of Alterations to Previously-Approved Construction (Architectural Features, Awnings, Entrances, Masonry, Windows) & New Construction (Retaining Wall) at 122 2<sup>nd</sup> Ave. N.; Brandon Priddy, Applicant.**

Ms. Rose stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for alterations to the previously-approved construction of the hotel component of the Harpeth Square PUD Development Plan. Previously, the Historic Zoning Commission approved the building's design and materials at its June 13, 2016 meeting. Ms. Rose stated the proposed alterations are limited to the following:

- Architectural Features—the proposed removal of the previously-approved balconies on the side elevations and their replacement with either windows, large box bay windows, or decorative cementitious paneling
- Windows/Doors—the minor alteration of the previously-approved fenestration pattern through the modification of groupings of windows and a storefront section on the recessed areas of the front elevation; the addition of service doors on the left (Bridge St.) elevation; the modification of storefront sections and the conversion of a couple of windows into doors on the right (Main St.) elevation
- Awnings—the proposed replacement of attached metal canopies over certain front and side elevation storefronts with fixed canvas awnings
- Masonry—the proposed use of brick in lieu of the previously-approved cast stone on certain portions of the front and side elevations

Ms. Rose stated the dimensions on each side elevation appear to be altered, the applicant has informed staff that the “final overall building dimensions correspond to dimensions included in previously submitted development and site plans. Ms. Rose stated the applicant appeared before the Design Review Committee (DRC) to discuss the proposal at its October 17, 2016 meeting. Ms. Rose stated it is recommended that the Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions the proposed alterations to the previously-approved construction, specifically the architectural features, awnings, masonry, entrances and windows associated with the hotel component of the development, with the following:

1. As conditions of approval for consistency with the *Guidelines*:
  - A. Transoms are required to be maintained over all storefronts for consistency with the *Guidelines* (p.97, p.126).
  - B. All awnings must be canvas, vinyl-coated, or acrylic in material and be sized only to cover the openings that they serve (p.100, #3-4).
  - C. The *Guidelines* recommend against the use of historically typical details “such as bay windows...” (p.109, #14). For consistency with the *Guidelines*, the box bay windows must be removed from the design and replaced with fenestration or detailing that is in keeping with the *Guidelines*. The replacement fenestration or detailing must be submitted to the Preservation Planner for review and approval in light of the *Guidelines* prior to issuance of a building permit.
2. The previously-issued COA conditions of approval shall remain valid.
3. All signage requires additional specification information for determination of eligibility for Certificates of Appropriateness. This information must be submitted in the form of COA application(s) at a later date.
4. The site plan must be approved by the City of Franklin, and the application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a

building permit. Any changes to the approved plans must be returned to the HZC for review and approval.

5. **Project consideration:**

- A. It is recommended that the trellis rendered over the access drive at the left (Bridge St.) side of the hotel building be simplified by utilizing a flat, pergola-style shape rather than the arched opening that is shown. The trellis was approved specifically to function as a transitional piece between the height of the adjacent historic building and the hotel building.
- B. The garage access door on the right (Main St.) elevation will be highly visible to vehicular traffic entering the garage through the opening adjacent to this location. It is recommended that the access door be designed more proportionally and more aesthetically in keeping with the adjacent storefront pattern.

Ms. Rose stated it is recommended that the Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions the proposed retaining wall, with the following:

1. As a condition of approval, the retaining wall material (brick) must be designed to be compatible with that of the development it serves, for consistency with the *Guidelines*.
2. The site plan must be approved by the City of Franklin, and the application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a building permit. Any changes to the approved plans must be returned to the HZC for review and approval.

Mr. Priddy stated he was happy to answer any questions.

Chairwoman Besser requested to know if any citizens would like to speak on this item and no one did.

Mr. Thompson moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #6293 for the alterations to the previously-approved construction, specifically the architectural features, awnings, masonry, entrances and windows associated with the hotel component of the development, in accordance with the *Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines* and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated November 14, 2016. Ms. Marquardt seconded the motion.

Ms. Pearce moved to amend the motion to include to not remove the bay windows. Mr. Thompson seconded the amendment and the amendment passed 8-0.

With the main motion, having been made and amended the motion passed 8-0.

After some discussion Mr. Roberts moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #6293 for the retaining wall, in accordance with the *Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines* and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated November 14, 2016. Mr. Carson seconded the motion and the motion passed 8-0.

**Item 10:**

**Consideration of Demolition (Principal) at 318 Franklin Rd.; Stephen Miller, Applicant.**

Mr. Hathaway rejoined the meeting.

Mr. Bryan stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the demolition of the principal structure located at 318 Franklin Rd. Mr. Bryan stated the building proposed for demolition

is a one-story Ranch-style home. Mr. Bryan stated per the Williamson County Property Assessor's Office, the home was built ca. 1951. Mr. Bryan stated it is recommended that the Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions the proposed demolition of the principal structure with the following:

1. The existing structure is not determined to add to the historic or architectural value for the period of significance defined for the Franklin Road Historic District, and because of this, its removal will not adversely affect the district's historic character. The building shall be satisfactorily documented with photographs and submitted to staff for the Commission records.
2. The application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a building permit. Any additional changes to approved plans must be returned to the HZC for review and approval.
3. Project Consideration
  - The subject building footprint is within the Hillside/Hillcrest Overlay District (HHO). The HHO protects the city's hillsides and hillcrests through the prohibition or restriction of development in a manner that will protect the local topography. Future development of the subject property will be limited to areas outside of the HHO.

Mr. Miller stated he was contracted by the owner to demolish the structure and to his knowledge there is nothing planned now to go back in its place.

Mr. Womack moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #6295 for the demolition of the principal structure in accordance with the *Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines* and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated November 14, 2016. Mr. Hathaway seconded the motion and the motion passed 9-0.

Ms. Pearce stated she is supporting this demolition due to it not adding to the Franklin Road corridor and it wouldn't meet the hillside ordinance, not because of the building's current state of repair.

#### **Item 11:**

#### **Non-agenda emergency items accepted by the commission for consideration.**

No non-agenda items.

#### **Item 12:**

#### **Items Approved by the Preservation Planner on Behalf of the Historic Zoning Commission, pursuant to the *Historic District Design Guidelines***

- **Fencing at 109 Cottage Ln.; Anthony Ponessa, Applicant.**

#### **Item 13:**

#### **Adjourn.**

With no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 6:37 p.m.

---

Acting Secretary