

**FRANKLIN HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MINUTES
November 9, 2015**

The Franklin Historic Zoning Commission held its regular scheduled meeting on Monday, November 9, 2015, at 5:00 pm in the City Hall Boardroom at 109 Third Avenue South.

Members Present: Chairwoman Susan Besser
 Mel Thompson
 Jim Roberts
 Mary Pearce
 Kate Reynolds
 Lisa Marquardt
 Trisha Nesbitt
 Rusty Womack

Staff Present: Amanda Hall, Planning & Sustainability Department
 Joey Bryan, Planning & Sustainability Department
 Steve Haynes, BNS Department
 Allen Lewis, BNS Department
 Kristen Corn, Law Department

Chairwoman Besser called to order the November 9, 2015, Historic Zoning Commission meeting at 5:01 p.m.

**Item 1:
Minutes: October 12, 2015**

Ms. Marquardt moved to approve the October minutes as submitted. Mr. Roberts seconded the motion, and the motion passed (8-0).

**Item 2:
Consideration of 2016 Historic Zoning Commission and Design Review Committee Meeting Dates and Application/Notification Deadlines.**

Mr. Thompson moved to approve the 2016 Meeting Dates and Application/Notification Deadlines. Ms. Marquardt seconded the motion, and the motion passed 8-0.

Item 3: Citizens Comments on Items Not on the Agenda

Open for Franklin citizens to be heard on items not included on this Agenda. As provided by law, the Historic Zoning Commission shall make no decisions or consideration of action of citizen comments, except to refer the matter to the Planning Director for administrative consideration, or to schedule the matter for Historic Zoning Commission consideration at a later date.

No comments for non-agenda items.

**Item 4:
Consideration of Alterations to Previously-Approved New Construction at Harpeth Square PUD Subdivision, located at Various Properties within the Block of E. Main St., 1st Ave. N., Bridge St., and 2nd Ave. N.; Gamble Design Collaborative, Applicant.**

Ms. Pearce recused herself from this item.

Ms. Hall stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the revision of previously-approved new construction retail spaces, attached housing, and a boutique hotel on a majority of a city block within the Downtown Franklin Historic District, specifically the block bounded by 1st Ave. N., Bridge St., 2nd Ave. N., and E. Main St. Ms. Hall stated the development plan was previously approved by the Franklin Board of Mayor and Aldermen at its March 24, 2015 meeting and was approved with conditions for issuance of a COA by the Historic Zoning Commission at its May 11, 2015 meeting. Ms. Hall stated the proposed revision is prompted by the applicant's request to include an additional parcel within the development plan and thus alter the building elevations and to accommodate the additional parcel and the proposed revision appears to affect the western portion of the development plan, specifically the Bridge St. elevation and setback and the non-hotel portion of the 2nd Ave. N. elevation (the portion of the façade that is proposed to be recessed behind the three existing buildings). Ms. Hall the current COA review is limited to the alterations proposed from the previously-approved plan only. Ms. Hall stated it is recommended from staff that the Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions the proposed alterations to the previously-approved new construction with the following:

1. The proposed revision to the previously-approved development plan must be approved by the Franklin Board of Mayor and Aldermen, and the application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a building permit. Any additional changes and/or proposed changes to HZC-approved plans must be returned to the HZC for review and approval, including, but not limited to, height, setback, material, and façade configuration/element alterations.
2. The previously-issued COA conditions of approval (dated May 11, 2015) remain valid.
3. Planning and Engineering staff have met with the applicant and determined the location of the right-of-ways for the roads around the Harpeth Square development. Along 1st Ave. North, the right-of-way will be located at the face of the building. Due to this determination, architectural appurtenances such as signage, balconies, and awnings may extend into the right-of-way in accordance with City of Franklin regulations.
4. All retaining walls, signage, awnings/metal roof overhangs, building-mounted lighting, and individual storefront configurations require additional specification information for determination of eligibility for Certificates of Appropriateness. This information must be submitted in the form of COA application(s) at a later date.
5. Outdoor seating areas, if proposed, are subject to issuance of Outdoor Café permits through the Building & Neighborhood Services Department.
6. The following element of the development plan was deferred for review at a later date by the Historic Zoning Commission on May 11, 2015, and is still subject for consideration and approval for issuance of a COA:
 - The three façade elevations of the hotel component of the development
7. The following element of the development has yet to be submitted for Historic Zoning Commission review and is still subject to consideration for issuance of a COA:
 - One freestanding building oriented to E. Main St. as shown on the development's corresponding site plan

Mr. Hathaway stated this was an opportunity to purchase this piece of property that will allow them to create a New Orleans-style courtyard. Mr. Hathaway stated this would give connection back to Bridge Street as well. Mr. Hathaway stated he would be glad to go into detail if needed.

Mr. Thompson moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #5972 for the alterations to the previously-approved new construction with staff's comments, in accordance with the *Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines*

and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated November 9, 2015. Mr. Roberts seconded the motion.

Ms. Hall projected the previously-approved plan for comparison to this submittal, and discussion ensued.

Ms. Marquardt requested clarification on what was to be considered today.

Mr. Roberts stated he understands we are reviewing the filling-in of the Bridge Street area.

Ms. Hall stated yes and a slight change in elevation and explained. Ms. Hall stated it does not change any height or setbacks.

With the main motion having been made and seconded, the motion passes 7-0.

Item 5:

Consideration of Development Plan Concept Approval for Robert Baker PUD Subdivision, located between 120 Lewisburg Ave. and 1011 Evans St.; Gamble Design Collaborative, Applicant.

Ms. Hall stated the applicant is requesting that the Historic Zoning Commission consider approval of a Development Plan Concept Plan for the subdivision of 120 Lewisburg Ave. so as to create a new lot fronting Evans St. (to be named 1011 Evans St.). Ms. Hall stated the development plan has not yet been reviewed or approved by the Franklin Municipal Planning Commission or the Franklin Board of Mayor and Aldermen. Ms. Hall explained this partial Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) review is limited to building height, massing, scale, and setbacks only and no building materials or façade design elements are being considered for issuance of a COA at this time. Ms. Hall stated these elements will be reviewed by the Historic Zoning Commission prior to or concurrently with the City of Franklin Site Plan review. Ms. Hall stated staff recommends that the Historic Zoning Commission approve the Development Plan Concept Plan with the following:

1. The conceptual building height, scale, massing, and setbacks are consistent with the *Guidelines*.
2. Please note that a Development Plan Concept Approval by the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission is a COA based on conceptual building height, massing, scale, and setbacks only. Building materials and architectural elevations are not considered during a Development Plan Concept Review and are subject to review and issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness by the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission prior to with the City of Franklin Site Plan review.

Ms. Hall stated the applicant should consider the 35% maximum building coverage recommendation of the *Guidelines* as building elevations and construction drawings are developed (p.61, #10; p.62, #6).

Mr. Lebovitz was present to represent this item and stated he was available for any questions the commission has.

Mr. Womack moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #5973 for the Development Plan Concept, limited to its building height, scale, massing, and setbacks, with staff's comments, in accordance with the *Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines* and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated November 9, 2015. Mr. Thompson seconded the motion.

Mr. Roberts stated he moved to add an amendment that particular emphasis be placed on the 35% maximum building coverage. Ms. Marquardt seconded the motion.

Ms. Pearce stated this lot appears to be much narrower than the other lots and that the packet does not show the other houses on the street.

Mr. Lebovitz stated the houses have the same setbacks of 5-feet off the property line.

Ms. Pearce stated the configuration shown is something she can never support and went into detail.

Mr. Lebovitz stated this is conceptual at this time and that when the final footprint is ready, he will come back to this commission.

Ms. Pearce stated when this comes back, they will be looking at the massing and scale.

Ms. Hall stated that the commission is asked to consider scale, massing and setbacks at this time.

Ms. Pearce stated she did not want the applicant to think, or anyone else, that the drawing shown is any direction this commission would approve.

Mr. Gamble stated they filed the development plan to Planning Commission today and that they are happy to bring the item back next month and show more. Mr. Gamble stated there are a variety of footprints all around this.

Ms. Pearce stated the HZC would be taking inspiration from the house that sits on the Lewisburg side instead of the picture provided.

Chairwoman Besser stated that there is a motion on the table and that she would take a vote.

With Mr. Roberts having made an amendment of a 35% maximum lot coverage emphasis, it passed unanimously (8-0).

Ms. Pearce stated she wanted to add an amendment that when we are approving the lot that we do not approve the footprint that was submitted. Ms. Reynolds seconded the motion, and the motion passed unanimously (8-0).

Discussion ensued on the massing and scale.

Ms. Hall explained that it was decided by the City that any development plans submitted within the HPO district appear before the HZC beforehand and that the only reason this item was brought before this commission tonight is because it is technically a development plan.

With the main motion having been made and amended twice, the motion passed unanimously (8-0).

Item 6:

Consideration of Addition & Alterations (Windows) at 204 3rd Ave. S.; Howard Switzer, Applicant.

Ms. Hall stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the placement of a 125 sq. ft. addition onto the rear of the residence located at 204 3rd Ave. S. and the applicant is requesting to alter the window openings on a non-historic portion of the residence. Ms. Hall stated it is recommended that the Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions the construction of the proposed addition and the window alterations with the following:

1. All windows must be wood in material and of a historically appropriate profile and dimension. Window specifications must be submitted to the Preservation Planner for review and approval prior to issuance of a building permit.
2. The application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a building permit. Any additional changes and/or proposed changes to HZC-approved plans must be returned to the HZC for review and approval.

Mr. Switzer stated the three windows are replacing a single small window. Mr. Switzer stated the addition will be a library area.

Chairwoman Besser requested to know if there were any citizens who wished to speak, and no one did.

Mr. Roberts moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #5968 for the proposed principal structure addition and window alterations with staff's comments, in accordance with the *Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines* and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated November 9, 2015. Ms. Reynolds seconded the motion.

Ms. Reynolds stated now that the big windows are proposed to be added, she is bothered by the one little window that does not match anything else on the elevation.

Mr. Switzer stated he client does not want to change that window.

Ms. Morrison stated the ceiling heights on the inside are different and that where the little window is, the ceiling is lower, and there is no room to change.

Ms. Pearce stated this might be an opportunity to add some lead glass windows on the top run of the library addition, much simplified.

With the motion having been made and seconded, it passed unanimously (8-0).

Item 7:

Consideration of Alterations (Rear: Roof Dormer) at 218 4th Ave. N.; Kate Reynolds, Applicant.

Ms. Hall stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the construction of a roof dormer at the rear elevation of the building located at 218 4th Ave. N. Ms. Hall stated it is recommended that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions the construction of the proposed rear elevation roof dormer with the following:

1. The lap siding exposure must be consistent with the exposure on the building.
2. All new windows must be wood in material and of a historically appropriate profile and dimension. Window specifications must be submitted to the Preservation Planner for review and approval prior to issuance of a building permit.
3. The application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a building permit. Any additional changes to HZC-approved plans must be returned to the HZC for review and approval.

Ms. Reynolds stated her only comment concerned recommendation number 1. Ms. Reynolds explained that the house exposure is three inches and that the existing dormer there now is four-and-one-half inches and that they want to match the four-and-one-half inches. Ms. Reynolds noted it is on the rear of the property.

Ms. Marquardt moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #5969 for the construction of the rear elevation roof dormer alteration with staff's comments, in accordance with the *Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines* and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated November 9, 2015. Ms. Pearce stated she would second with an amendment that the windows on the dormer have sashes.

Ms. Reynolds asked if Ms. Pearce meant not to use casement windows.

Ms. Pearce moved to add an amendment that the casement windows on the rear dormer that are being added have the traditional configuration and come back to staff for approval. Mr. Womack seconded the amendment and clarified that Ms. Pearce wants a double-hung and not casement look. The amendment passed.

With the main motion having been made and amended, it passed unanimously (7-0).

Item 8:

Consideration of Awnings & Signage at 435 Main St.; Amber Andres, Applicant.

This Item was pulled from the agenda by the applicant.

Item 9:

Consideration of Awning & Signage at 326 Main St.; James Frazier, Applicant.

Ms. Hall stated Ms. Reynolds has recused herself from this item.

Ms. Hall stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the placement of a closed-end shed awning featuring business-identifier signage over the window and transom area on the building located at 326 Main St. and the applicant is proposing the placement of a window decal signage. Ms. Hall stated due to the design of the proposed signage, it has been determined that this proposal does not qualify for Administrative Review and therefore, it has been forwarded to the Historic Zoning Commission for consideration. Ms. Hall stated it is recommended that the Historic Zoning Commission deny the proposed business-identifier awning and the window decal sign with the following:

1. The proposed awning design is inconsistent with the *Guidelines*, as it is proposed to obscure a character-defining architectural feature on the building and features more signage than is recommended (p.96, #5; p.116, #16). Based on the applicant's submitted information, it is also unclear what the dimensions of the awning lettering is proposed to be, so the application is not complete enough to determine consistency with all applicable *Guidelines* nor to determine adherence to applicable Franklin Zoning Ordinance sign regulations.
2. The design of the proposed window decal signage is not consistent with the *Guidelines*. The design of the proposed window decal signage does not appear to be consistent with the regulations of the Franklin Zoning Ordinance, listed at Section 5.12.11 (9)(b).
3. If issued a COA, the application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a sign permit.
4. Any additional changes and/or proposed changes to the HZC-approved plans must be returned to the HZC for review and approval.

Ms. Shannon Toohey stated she was in agreement with all of staff's comments and would make the changes requested by staff.

Mr. Roberts moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission deny issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #5974 for the placement of the business-identifier awning and window

decal signage with staff's comments, in accordance with the *Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines* and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated November 9, 2015. Mr. Thompson seconded the motion.

Discussion ensued on location and what was there originally.

Ms. Pearce moved to defer to the Design Review Committee for additional discussion. Mr. Womack seconded the motion, and the motion passed unanimously (8-0).

Item 10:

Consideration of Partial Demolition (Rear Wall) & Alterations (Rear: Masonry, Windows/Doors, Skylight Dormer, Entry Porch, Ramp, Lighting, Signage) at 338 Main St.; Glen Oxford, Applicant.

This Item was pulled from the agenda by the applicant.

Item 11:

Other Business.

No other business.

Item 12:

Adjourn.

With no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 6:10 p.m.

Acting Secretary