

**FRANKLIN HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION  
MINUTES  
July 13, 2015**

The Franklin Historic Zoning Commission held its regular scheduled meeting on Monday, July 13, 2015, at 5:00 pm in the City Hall Boardroom at 109 Third Avenue South.

Members Present:      Chairwoman Susan Besser  
                                 Lisa Marquardt  
                                 Mel Thompson  
                                 Jim Roberts  
                                 Trisha Nesbitt  
                                 Mary Pearce  
                                 Mike Hathaway

Staff Present:            Amanda Hall, Planning & Sustainability Department  
                                 Susan Coleman, Planning & Sustainability Department  
                                 Steve Haynes, BNS Department  
                                 Randall Tosh, BNS Department  
                                 Kristen Corn, Law Department

Chairwoman Besser called to order the July 13, 2015, Historic Zoning Commission meeting at 5:00 p.m.

**Item 1:  
Minutes: June 8, 2015**

Chairwoman Besser requested a correction be made to Item 15, at the bottom of the page in Ms. Hall's recommendation of denial it should state "which is not consistent with the guidelines" instead of "which is consistent with the guidelines."

Ms. Pearce moved to approve the June minutes with the noted correction. Mr. Roberts seconded the motion, and the motion passed (7-0).

**Item 2: Citizens Comments on Items Not on the Agenda**

Open for Franklin citizens to be heard on items not included on this Agenda. As provided by law, the Historic Zoning Commission shall make no decisions or consideration of action of citizen comments, except to refer the matter to the Planning Director for administrative consideration, or to schedule the matter for Historic Zoning Commission consideration at a later date.

No comments for non-agenda items.

**Item 3: Consent Agenda**

The items under the consent agenda are deemed by the commission to be routine in nature and will be approved by one motion adopting the staff comments as part of the approval. The items on the consent agenda will not be discussed. Any member of the commission or the public desiring to discuss an item on the consent agenda may request that it be removed and placed on the regular agenda. It will then be considered in its printed order. Staff recommends that item 4 be placed on the consent agenda.

Ms. Marquardt moved to approve the Consent Agenda. Mr. Roberts seconded the motion, and the motion passed with Mr. Thompson voting no.

Discussion ensued on whether or not a noncontributing structure should be reviewed and whether the suggested solution would fix the issue.

Chairwoman Besser suggested the motion be withdrawn for approving the item on consent.

Ms. Marquardt moved to withdraw her motion to have this item placed on the Consent Agenda. Mr. Roberts seconded the motion.

**Item 4:**

**Consideration of Alterations (Windows) at 145 2<sup>nd</sup> Ave. S.; Norman Pryor, Applicant.**

Ms. Hall stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the placement of copper window caps over a majority of the windows at 145 2<sup>nd</sup> Ave. S. Ms. Hall stated the caps are proposed to match one existing cap and to only be placed over windows that are not covered by existing awnings or porch areas. Ms. Hall stated Staff recommends approval of the placement of the window caps with the following:

1. The application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department. Any additional changes and/or proposed changes to HZC-approved plans must be returned to the HZC for review and approval.

Mr. Quirk stated there has been a lot of discussion on these flashings, explained there was one put on with previous owners, and stated that for the flashing to do its job, it must be behind whatever waterproofing is on that wall and that brick removal may be required.

Ms. Marquardt moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #5878 for the placement of the window caps, with staff's comments, in accordance with the *Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines* and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated July 13, 2015. Mr. Roberts seconded the motion.

Discussion ensued among commissioners.

Ms. Pearce moved to make an amendment that either copper or the material shown in packet be used. Mr. Thompson seconded the motion.

Ms. Pearce withdrew the motion and made a new motion to amend the original motion that copper or the material shown in packet be used and extend passed the window about 2 inches. Mr. Thompson seconded the motion. The amendment passed 7-0.

The original motion having been made and amended passed 7-0.

**Item 5:**

**Consideration of Addition and Deck at 104 Lewisburg Ave.; Kevin Coffey, Applicant.**

Ms. Hall stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the construction of an approx. 647 sq. ft. footprint two-story addition in place of an existing addition (previously-approved for demolition on 6/8/15). Ms. Hall stated a deck is also proposed on the rear and side of the addition and a pergola is proposed for use at the rear of the addition to lessen the size of the roof coverage percentage. Ms. Hall stated the applicant appeared before the Design Review Committee (DRC) to discuss the proposal at its June 15, 2015 meeting. Ms. Hall stated Staff recommends approval with conditions of the proposed addition and deck with the following:

- a) As a condition of approval, all windows must be wood in material and of a historically appropriate profile and dimension. Window specifications must be submitted to the Preservation Planner for review and approval prior to issuance of a building permit.
- b) As a condition of approval, the deck railings must be wood in material. Deck material specifications must be submitted to the Preservation Planner for review and approval prior to issuance of a building permit.
- c) The application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a building permit. Any additional changes and/or proposed changes to HZC-approved plans must be returned to the HZC for review and approval.
  - Any interior or exterior demolition that may compromise the exterior materials, details, or forms of the existing residence must be reviewed and approved by the HZC prior to work proceeding.
  - Foundation height surveys may be required at the time of building permit review to ensure compatibility with the height and massing conditions set forth within the project's corresponding Certificate of Appropriateness.

Mr. Coffey stated he did not have much to add except that they are really not adding very much more square footage coverage to the house and that it is a huge positive. Mr. Coffey stated this design simplifies the roof situation and gets them under the 50% coverage.

Mr. Hathaway moved to approve Project PL #5880 as submitted. Ms. Marquardt seconded the motion.

Ms. Pearce moved to amend the main motion to include with staff's comments. Mr. Thompson seconded the motion. The motion passed 7-0.

Discussion ensued.

With the main motion having been made and amended, it passed 7-0.

#### **Item 6:**

#### **Consideration of Alteration to Previously-Approved Plans (Porch) at 119 Lewisburg Ave.; Kevin Coffey, Applicant.**

Ms. Hall stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for an alteration to the previously-approved side porch area at 119 Lewisburg Ave. Ms. Hall stated Staff recommends approval with conditions of the alteration to the previously-approved plans with the following:

1. As a condition of approval, no historic elements of the building may be removed to allow for the placement of the screening, in accordance with the *Guidelines*.
2. The application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a building permit. Any additional changes and/or proposed changes to HZC-approved plans must be returned to the HZC for review and approval.

Mr. Coffey stated when the glass block in the picture window was removed, they discovered a huge gap in between the stone and frame behind it. Mr. Coffey explained that something will have to be done to cover the gap, so the clients would like a screen porch.

Ms. Marquardt moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #5883 for the alteration to the previously-approved plans, specifically the use of screening in lieu of glass at the side porch area, with staff's comments, in accordance with the *Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines* and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated July 13, 2015. Ms. Nesbitt seconded the motion.

Discussion ensued among commissioners with the chair calling for vote.

The motion passed 7-0.

**Items 7:**

**Consideration of Alterations (Storefront, Shutters) at 121 2<sup>nd</sup> Ave. N.; Steve Bacon, Applicant.**

Mr. Hathaway recused himself from this item and left the room.

Ms. Hall stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the placement of a 4-window storefront and the placement of shutters onto the existing front elevation windows. Ms. Hall stated though the proposed rendering demonstrates a couple of awnings, the applicant has requested that no awnings be considered for review at this time. Ms. Hall stated Staff recommends approval with conditions of the placement of the 4-window storefront and the placement of the window shutters on the front elevation with the following:

1. The proposed storefront windows are determined to be appropriate, as the building is noncontributing and the alteration is mostly supportive of the character of the Downtown Franklin Historic District.
  - In light of the *Guidelines* for consistency with other storefronts in the historic district, however, the storefront must include transom lights at the top of each window.
  - Bulkheads are also typical of storefront design and must be included for consistency with the *Guidelines*, but as a stucco-clad non-contributing structure, wood bulkheads are more appropriate for use than those of brick.
2. The proposed shutter placement may also be appropriate in light of the character of the building and the historic district.
  - Shutter specifications must be submitted to the Preservation Planner for review and approval prior to application to order to ensure compliance with the *Guidelines*.
3. The application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a building permit. Any additional changes and/or proposed changes to HZC-approved plans (including, but not limited to, exterior masonry painting, lighting, awnings, and signage) must be returned to the HZC for review and approval.

Mr. Bacon stated they have been renovating this building for the last couple of months and they decided they would like to do something to exterior and came up with this plan.

Mr. Roberts moved to approve that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #5884 for the placement of the storefront windows, with staff's comments, in accordance with the *Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines* and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated July 13, 2015. Ms. Nesbitt seconded the motion.

Discussion ensued concerning having doors on both sides on the front elevation, which may cause a codes issue.

Mr. Thompson moved to amend the original motion to include to allow the applicant to either install doors or change out the existing doors for windows, to not install the transom and upon approval from Codes, as shown on the Ben Johnson rendering presented within the application. Ms. Pearce seconded the motion, and the amendment passed.

With the main motion having been made and amended the motion passed 6-0.

Chairwoman Besser stated she was open to a motion for the shutters.

Ms. Nesbitt moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #5884 for the placement of the window shutters onto the front elevation, with staff's comments, in accordance with the *Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines* and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated July 13, 2015. Mr. Roberts seconded the motion.

After minor discussion the motion passed 6-0.

**Item 8:**

**Consideration of Addition (Principal), Alterations (Gutters, Deck Extension) at 215 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue South; Howard Switzer, Applicant.**

Ms. Hall stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the construction of a covered exterior rain barrel closet at the rear of the house located at 215 5<sup>th</sup> Ave. S. Ms. Hall stated the applicant is also proposing the construction of an exterior rain barrel closet at the driveway-facing elevation of the garage as well as the placement of copper and bronze gutters onto the house and garage and the extension of the rear deck area by 2 feet. Ms. Hall stated Staff recommends approval with conditions of the application with the following:

1. As a condition of approval in accordance of the *Guidelines*, the applicant shall place the downspouts away from architectural features and on the least public elevations. The downspout locations must be reviewed and approved by the Preservation Planner prior to installation.
2. The application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a building permit. Any additional changes and/or proposed changes to HZC-approved plans must be returned to the HZC for review and approval.

Mr. Switzer stated there were just the two closets with shed roofs to put 500-gallon tanks in to collect rain water and that in other places, decorative urns will be used.

Ms. Pearce moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve as submitted with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #5879 for the construction of the covered rain barrel closets at the principal and accessory structures, with staff's comments, in accordance with the *Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines* and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated July 13, 2015. Mr. Thompson seconded the motion, and the motion passed 6-0.

Mr. Switzer stated he needed to add one window, one window would be moved, and one window will be enclosed.

Mr. Hathaway moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #5879 for the placement of the gutters and downspouts, with staff's comments, in accordance with the *Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines* and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated July 13, 2015. Mr. Thompson seconded the motion, and the motion passed 6-0.

Ms. Pearce moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #5879 for the extension of the rear deck, with staff's comments, in accordance with the *Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines* and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated July 13, 2015. Ms. Nesbitt seconded the motion and the motion passed 6-0.

**Item 9:**

**Consideration of Addition at 214 Franklin Rd.; Ron Shuff, Applicant.**

Ms. Hall stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the enclosure of an existing 2<sup>nd</sup>-story deck at the rear of the home located at 214 Franklin Rd. Ms. Hall stated the roofing is proposed to address water damage concerns. Ms. Hall stated the applicant appeared before the Design Review Committee (DRC) to discuss the proposal at its June 15, 2015 meeting. Ms. Hall stated Staff recommends approval with conditions of the proposed addition with the following:

- a) As a condition of approval, all windows must be wood in material and of a historically appropriate profile and dimension. Window specifications must be submitted to the Preservation Planner for review and approval prior to issuance of a building permit.
- b) The application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a building permit. Any additional changes and/or proposed changes to HZC-approved plans must be returned to the HZC for review and approval. Any additional changes to HZC-approved plans must be returned to the HZC for review and approval.
  - Any demolition that may compromise the exterior materials, details, or forms of the existing residence must be reviewed and approved by the HZC prior to work proceeding.

Mr. Shuff stated he agrees with staff's comments and stated there was water damage causing changes.

Mr. Roberts moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission **approve with conditions** a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #5881 for the **principal structure addition** with **staff's comments**, in accordance with the *Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines* and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated July 13, 2015. Ms. Marquardt seconded the motion, and the motion passed 7-0.

#### **Item 10:**

#### **Consideration of Partial Demolition (Principal), Addition, and Alterations (Siding) at 223 Bridge St.; Ron Shuff, Applicant.**

Ms. Hall stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for a series of work at 223 Bridge Street and the proposed scope of work is as follows:

- Demolition of a non-historic garage addition at the right side of the house;
- Construction of an approx. 563 sq. ft. footprint addition at the rear of the house;
- Replacing of synthetic siding material on the existing house with cementitious siding.

Ms. Hall stated the applicant appeared before the Design Review Committee (DRC) to discuss the proposal at its June 8, 2015 meeting. Ms. Hall stated Staff recommends approval with conditions of the proposed partial demolition of the principal structure and the replacement of the synthetic siding with cementitious siding with the following:

- a) As a condition of approval, all windows must be wood in material and of a historically appropriate profile and dimension. Window specifications must be submitted to the Preservation Planner for review and approval prior to issuance of a building permit.
- b) Staff recommends the use of smooth cementitious siding as opposed to the use of embossed wood grain cementitious siding.
- c) The application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a building permit. Any additional changes and/or proposed changes to HZC-approved plans must be returned to the HZC for review and approval. Any additional changes to HZC-approved plans must be returned to the HZC for review and approval.
  - All approved exterior demolition is limited to what is indicated on the application plan set. Any interior or exterior demolition that may compromise the exterior

materials, details, or forms of the existing residence must be reviewed and approved by the HZC prior to work proceeding.

Ms. Hall stated Staff recommends denial of the proposed principal structure addition with the following:

- a) The footprint of the proposed enclosed addition is approximately 74 percent of the historic structure (discounting areas proposed for demolition), which is not consistent with the *Guidelines*. The *Guidelines* recommend limiting the square footage of addition to no more than half of the square footage of the footprint of the original building (p.52, #3).
- b) If approved, the application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a building permit. Any additional changes and/or proposed changes to HZC-approved plans must be returned to the HZC for review and approval. Any additional changes to HZC-approved plans must be returned to the HZC for review and approval.
  - All approved exterior demolition is limited to what is indicated on the application plan set. Any interior or exterior demolition that may compromise the exterior materials, details, or forms of the existing residence must be reviewed and approved by the HZC prior to work proceeding.
  - The proposed parking lot at the rear of the property may qualify for a site plan review by the City of Franklin.

Mr. Shuff stated he pretty much agrees with everything except Ms. Hall stated except for the footprint issue, and he referenced page 52 of the *Guidelines* document. Mr. Shuff stated he comes up with 783 sq. ft. on main portion, 64 sq. ft. on front porch, and 147 sq. ft. on back porch, which comes up to 994 sq. ft., which with the addition of 501 sq. ft. is not 74%. Mr. Shuff stated there is 240 sq. ft. of the garage, which will be demolished.

Mr. Wilson stated they come up with 1234 sq. ft. under roof.

Ms. Hall explained how staff came up with the footprint they did. Ms. Hall stated the garage cannot be added as square feet.

Discussion ensued on whose square footage was correct.

Mr. Roberts moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #5882 for the partial demolition of the principal structure with staff's comments, in accordance with the *Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines* and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated July 13, 2015. Mr. Hathaway seconded the motion, and the motion passed 7-0.

Mr. Thompson moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #5882 for the siding alterations with staff's comments, in accordance with the *Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines* and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated July 13, 2015. Mr. Hathaway seconded the motion.

Discussion ensued on the siding.

Ms. Pearce moved to amend the motion to include staff is given the opportunity to access the siding condition and allow staff to make the decision as to whether keep old siding or replace. Ms. Nesbitt seconded the motion. With Ms. Hall stating she would be okay with making this decision as long as the applicant understands if this material is salvageable, it must be maintained or otherwise come back to this commission. The motion passed 7-0.

With the main motion having been made and amended, it passed 7-0.

Discussion ensued on the addition.

Mr. Shuff passed around a new plan that Ms. Hall had not yet seen.

Ms. Marquardt moved to deny issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #5882 for the construction of the addition with staff's comments, in accordance with the *Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines* and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated July 13, 2015.

There was no second, so the motion died.

Ms. Pearce stated she would be in some way forgiving to remove the garage and not stay to meet the guideline.

Mr. Hathaway moved to approve the addition as submitted without staff's comments, but with his conditions that the form of the back addition should not mimic roof structure of the front addition and should be simplified to have a single pitch roof with a connection. Mr. Thompson seconded the motion.

Chairwoman Besser stated she felt this was getting into DRC.

Ms. Pearce stated she agreed, but this was the commission's last item and it is not extremely late, so she would be okay with additional discussion.

Chairwoman Besser stated she felt the documentation does not show the numbers and that she struggles with that.

Mr. Thompson stated the paperwork should go to Ms. Hall and let her do the new calculations, but he does have an issue with the architectural design.

Mr. Shuff presented a completely new drawing that Ms. Hall had not seen.

After discussion Mr. Thompson withdrew his second from the motion.

Ms. Pearce seconded Mr. Hathaway's motion.

Mr. Shuff stated he could not wait any additional time and if this was not approved, he would just scrap the whole project.

After further discussion the motion passed with 4-3, with Chairwoman Besser voting no.

**Item 11:**

**Items Approved by the Preservation Planner on Behalf of the Historic Zoning Commission, pursuant to the *Historic District Design Guidelines*.**

- **Fencing at 22 Daniels Dr.; Kevin & Shannon Pellatiro, Applicants.**
- **Signage at 400 Main St. Ste. 100; Megan Weisinger, Applicant.**
- **Fencing at 206 Franklin Rd.; Andy Ferguson, Applicant.**
- **Fencing at 321 3<sup>rd</sup> Ave. S.; J. Lawrence Sullivan, Applicant.**
- **Signage at 430 Main St.; Kim Briggs & Sierra Jacobson, Applicants.**



**Item 12:**  
**Other Business.**

Ms. Pearce moved to have Ms. Hall move forward with setting up a *Design Guidelines* update workshop.

**Item 13:**  
**Adjourn.**

With no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 7:15 p.m.

---

Acting Secretary