

**FRANKLIN HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
MINUTES
June 8, 2015**

The Franklin Historic Zoning Commission held its regular scheduled meeting on Monday, June 8, 2015, at 5:00 pm in the City Hall Boardroom at 109 Third Avenue South.

Members Present: Chairwoman Susan Besser
 Lisa Marquardt
 Mel Thompson
 Jim Roberts
 Rusty Womack
 Trisha Nesbitt
 Kate Reynolds, arrived at 5:15 p.m.
 Mary Pearce, arrived at 5:07 p.m.

Staff Present: Amanda Hall, Planning & Sustainability Department
 Steve Haynes, BNS Department
 Randall Tosh, BNS Department
 Kristen Corn, Law Department

Chairwoman Besser called to order the June 8, 2015, Historic Zoning Commission meeting at 5:03 p.m.

**Item 1:
Minutes: May 11, 2015**

Mr. Roberts moved to approve the June minutes as submitted. Mr. Thompson seconded the motion, and the motion passed (6-0).

**Item 2:
Citizens Comments on Items Not on the Agenda**

Open for Franklin citizens to be heard on items not included on this Agenda. As provided by law, the Historic Zoning Commission shall make no decisions or consideration of action of citizen comments, except to refer the matter to the Planning Director for administrative consideration, or to schedule the matter for Historic Zoning Commission consideration at a later date.

No comments for non-agenda items.

Item 3: Consent Agenda.

The items under the consent agenda are deemed by the commission to be routine in nature and will be approved by one motion adopting the staff comments as part of the approval. The items on the consent agenda will not be discussed. Any member of the commission or the public desiring to discuss an item on the consent agenda may request that it be removed and placed on the regular agenda. It will then be considered in its printed order. Staff recommends that items 5-9 be placed on the consent agenda.

Mr. Womack moved to approve the Consent Agenda. Ms. Marquardt seconded the motion, and the motion passed 6-0.

**Item 4:
Consideration of Amendments to the Historic Zoning Commission Bylaws.**

Mr. Roberts moved to approve the amendments to the bylaws. Ms. Marquardt seconded the motion and the motion passed 6-0.

**Item 5:
Consideration of Demolition (COA Extension) at 104 E. Main St.; Greg Gamble, Applicant.**

This Item was approved on the Consent Agenda.

**Item 6:
Consideration of Principal Demolition (COA Extension) at 107 1st Ave. N.; Greg Gamble, Applicant.**

This Item was approved on the Consent Agenda.

**Items 7:
Consideration of Accessory Demolition (COA Extension) at 107 1st Ave. N.; Greg Gamble, Applicant.**

This Item was approved on the Consent Agenda.

**Item 8:
Consideration of Secondary Principal Demolition (COA Extension) at 134 2nd Ave. S.; Greg Gamble, Applicant.**

This Item was approved on the Consent Agenda.

**Item 9:
Consideration of Demolition (COA Extension) at 113 Bridge St.; Greg Gamble, Applicant.**

This Item was approved on the Consent Agenda.

**Item 10:
Consideration of Demolition (Principal) at 121 Morningside Dr.; Paul Sims, Applicant.**

Ms. Hall stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the demolition of the house located at 121 Morningside Dr. Ms. Hall stated the item appeared before the Historic Zoning Commission at its March 8, 2010 meeting, and the request was denied. Ms. Hall stated the item then appeared before the Historic Zoning Commission at its January 9, 2012 meeting, and it was deferred to Design Review Committee for more information to be ascertained through a site visit, which took place on January 17, 2012. Ms. Hall stated Staff recommends deferral of the proposed principal structure demolition with the following:

1. Staff recommends that consideration of demolition be deferred until rehabilitation estimates have been supplied to the HZC for consideration, as recommended by the *Guidelines*.
2. If the Historic Zoning Commission approves demolition, the building must be satisfactorily documented inside and out with photographs and submitted to staff for the Commission records.

3. If the Historic Zoning Commission approves demolition, the application must meet all of the requirements of the Building and Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a building permit.

Mr. Sims stated everything would have to be redone and they do not want to build on the foundation that exists now. Mr. Sims stated this home is too far gone to save.

Chairwoman Besser requested to know if there were any citizens who wished to comment, and no one requested to speak.

Ms. Pearce moved to defer to the next Design Review Committee meeting. Ms. Nesbitt seconded the motion.

Chairwoman Besser stated with a motion having been made, the item was open for discussion, and discussion ensued.

Ms. Pearce amended her motion to include bringing additional information. Mr. Thompson seconded the amendment, and the amendment passed 7-1, with Mr. Roberts voting no.

With the main motion having been made and amended, it passed 7-1, with Mr. Roberts voting no.

Item 11:

Consideration of Wall at 122 Lewisburg Ave.; Sean Miller, Applicant.

Ms. Hall stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the construction of a seat wall to be located near the intersection of W. Fowlkes St. and Lewisburg Ave., outside of the public right-of-way. Ms. Hall stated Staff recommends approval with conditions of the construction of the seat wall with the following:

1. Seat walls are not specifically addressed by the *Guidelines*. The proposal appears to meet the intent of the retaining wall recommendations, however, as it is proposed to consist of a relatively low height (20" wall with 24" caps), appropriate placement (near property line but instead the right-of-way), and recommended materials (natural limestone and brick).
2. The application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department. Any additional proposed changes to HZC-approved plans must be returned to the HZC for review and approval.

Mr. Miller stated he provided additional photos showing other walls.

Chairwoman Besser requested to know if there were any citizens who wished to comment, and no one requested to speak.

Ms. Marquardt moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #5858 for the construction of the seat wall with staff's comments, in accordance with the *Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines* and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated June 8, 2015. Mr. Roberts seconded the motion.

Chairwoman Besser opened the floor to commissioners for discussion.

After discussion Mr. Thompson moved to amend the motion to include that the wall be all stacked 4" stone with a top soldier look as we see in more historic natural stone walls. Mr. Roberts seconded the amendment, and the amendment passed 8-0.

With the main motion having been made and amended, it passed 8-0.

Item 12:

Consideration of Alterations (Windows) at 119 Lewisburg Ave.; Kevin Coffey, Applicant.

Ms. Hall stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the replacement of original windows on the remaining portion of the house located at 119 Lewisburg Ave. Ms. Hall stated the contractor for the project appeared before the Design Review Committee (DRC) to discuss the window replacement proposal only at its December 15, 2014 meeting and the applicant appeared before the DRC to discuss the proposal at its May 18, 2015 meeting. Ms. Hall stated Staff recommends approval with conditions of the replacement of the windows with the following:

1. The windows have been removed, with some discarded. With only six original windows remaining from various locations of the original house, there are not sufficient windows remaining to address the window openings on the remaining facades.
 - a. As a condition of approval, the proposed replacement windows must match the window specifications included within the application to ensure consistency with the *Guidelines*.
2. The application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a building permit. Any additional changes and/or proposed changes to HZC-approved plans must be returned to the HZC for review and approval.

Mr. Coffey stated he felt everything was covered at DRC but that he was happy to answer any questions.

Chairwoman Besser requested to know if there were any citizens who wished to comment, and no one requested to speak.

Mr. Womack moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #5856 for the replacement of the original windows with staff's **comments**, in accordance with the *Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines* and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated June 8, 2015. Ms. Pearce seconded the motion.

Ms. Pearce stated she would like to amend the motion to take out staff's comment letter "A". Ms. Marquardt seconded the amendment, and it passed 8-0.

With the main motion having been made and amended, it passed 8-0.

Item 13:

Consideration of Alterations (Canopies, Roofline/Dormer Addition, Porch, Windows/Doors) at 230 Franklin Rd. (Bldg. 1); David Pack, Applicant.

Ms. Hall stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for a series of work at Bldg. 1 at the Factory at Franklin. Ms. Hall noted historically, it served as the administrative office building for the factory. Ms. Hall stated Staff recommends approval with conditions of the proposed

- Front elevation patio fencing;
- Single front entry canopy only;
- Dormer enlargement/roofline alteration;

- Deck railing and patio roofing;
- Utilities screening; and
- Side elevation awning

with the following:

1. As a condition of approval, the side elevation awning must be canvas, vinyl-coated, or acrylic for consistency with the *Guidelines*.
2. The application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a building permit, and any additional changes to HZC-approved plans must be returned to the HZC for review and approval.

Ms. Hall stated Staff recommends denial of the proposed:

- Front elevation patio canopies (not including the front entry canopy);
- Conversion of front elevation window openings to door openings; and
- Shutters

with the following:

- a) The proposed canopies proposed to be newly extended over the patio areas to be created on the left and right sides of the entry door are inconsistent with the *Guidelines*, as they state that “awnings should cover only the storefront display windows or transoms and fit within their openings.”
- b) The conversion of window openings to door openings on the front façade is not consistent with the *Guidelines*, as the *Guidelines* recommend that one preserve and retain original window and openings dimensions.
- c) The proposed plantation shutters will obscure windows and therefore are inconsistent with the *Guidelines*. Louvered wood shutters may be an appropriate alternative on non-dormer window locations where they are able to fit the openings, as they are historically appropriate to Colonial Revival style buildings.
- d) If issued a COA, the application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a building permit, and any additional changes to HZC-approved plans must be returned to the HZC for review and approval.

Mr. Burke stated he was the architect for this item. Mr. Burke stated everything they are trying to do is to leave the historic building visible and untouched by the addition. Mr. Burke referenced photos in the commissioner’s packet and explained why they chose what they did.

Chairwoman Besser requested to know if there were any citizens who wished to comment, and no one requested to speak.

Ms. Pearce moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #5857 for the front elevation patio fencing, single front entry canopy only, dormer enlargement/roofline alteration, deck railing and patio roofing, utilities screening, and side elevation awning. Mr. Womack seconded the motion.

Discussion ensued between commissioners and applicant.

Mr. Roberts moved to amend the motion to remove the front elevation patio fencing. Ms. Reynolds seconded the motion, and the motion passed 8-0.

With the main motion having been made and amended it passed 8-0.

Mr. Roberts moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission deny issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #5857 for the front entrance patio fencing, front elevation patio canopies (not including the front entry canopy), conversion of front elevation window openings to door openings, and shutters at Bldg. 1 with staff's comments. Ms. Marquardt seconded the motion.

Discussion ensued between commissioners and applicant.

Ms. Pearce called for vote, and the motion passed 7-1 with Ms. Reynolds opposing.

Ms. Pearce made a motion to deny the shutters as presented on the application. Ms. Nesbitt seconded the motion, and the motion passed 7-1 with Mr. Womack voting no.

Mr. Womack moved to approve the window openings to door openings with true divided light. Ms. Pearce seconded the motion, and the motion passed 6-3 with Mr. Roberts, Ms. Marquardt and Chairwoman Besser voting no.

Mr. Womack moved to approve the side elevation canopies and fencing with no flower boxes. Ms. Nesbitt seconded the motion.

Mr. Thompson moved to amend the motion to remove the railing. Due to lack of a second, the motion failed.

Ms. Marquardt moved to amend the motion to have the fencing come back to DRC. Mr. Thompson seconded the motion, and the motion passed 8-0.

With the main motion having been made and amended, the motion passed 7-1.

Item 14:

Consideration of Addition and Alterations (Roofline, Windows, Dormers) at 417 Boyd Mill Ave.; Troy Shafer, Applicant.

Ms. Hall stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the construction of 527 sq. ft. rear addition to the residence at 417 Boyd Mill Ave. and proposing to alter the roofline at a non-original portion of the rear of the house to adjust its height and to add dormers to each side elevation. Ms. Hall stated additionally the applicant is requesting window opening alterations on the left elevation, the replacement of vinyl windows on the left elevation, and the placement of a new three-bay window set on the right elevation are all proposed. Ms. Hall stated the applicant appeared before the Design Review Committee (DRC) to discuss the proposal at its May 18, 2015 meeting. Ms. Hall stated Staff recommends approval with conditions of the proposed addition, roofline and dormer alterations, and placement of new windows with the following:

- As a condition of approval, the addition roof ridge cannot exceed the height of the existing house. Additionally, the lap reveal of the new cementations siding must be consistent with that of the existing house.
- All new windows must be wood in material and of a historically appropriate profile and dimension. Window specifications must be submitted to the Preservation Planner for review and approval prior to issuance of a building permit.
- The application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a building permit. Any additional changes to HZC-approved plans must be returned to the HZC for review and approval. All approved exterior demolition is limited to what is indicated on the application plan set. Any demolition that may

- compromise the exterior materials, details, or forms of the existing residence must be reviewed and approved by the HZC prior to work proceeding.
- A scaled set of all elevations notating the following must be submitted to the Preservation Planner prior to issuance of a building permit:
 - all approved building materials, including foundation material and lap reveal; and
 - the overall height of the addition areas in relation to its existing residence's overall height and eave heights.

Ms. Hall stated Staff recommends denial of the proposed alteration of the existing window openings with the following:

- The proposed window opening alterations on the left elevation are not entirely in keeping with the *Guidelines*. Original window openings are recommended to be preserved and maintained.

Mr. Shafer stated he was the contractor for the project and Mr. Coffey is the architect.

Mr. Coffey stated he wanted to address the issue of windows on the left side and explained at the kitchen area they are restoring that back to the original opening. Mr. Coffey stated the other openings on the left side consists of a laundry room and closet and that a new entry is proposed as well. Mr. Coffey stated they were fine with staff's conditions.

Chairwoman Besser requested to know if there were any citizens who wished to comment, and no one requested to speak.

Ms. Marquardt moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #5854 for the addition, roofline and dormer alterations, and the placement of the new windows with staff's comments, in accordance with the *Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines* and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated June 8, 2015. Ms. Reynolds seconded the motion.

Discussion ensued with commissioners and applicant.

Ms. Pearce moved to amend the motion to include that any interior or exterior demolition must be approved by HZC. Ms. Reynolds seconded the motion and the motion passed 8-0.

With the main motion having been made and amended passes 8-0.

Ms. Marquardt that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission deny a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #5854 for the alteration of the existing window openings with staff's comments, in accordance with the *Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines* and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated June 8, 2015. Ms. Reynolds seconded the motion.

Discussion ensued on the windows.

Ms. Pearce called for the vote.

With the main motion having been made by Ms. Marquardt, it failed 1-6 with Ms. Ms. Marquardt being the only one voting yes.

Mr. Thompson moved to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #5854 for the alteration of the existing window openings with staff's comments, in accordance with the *Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines* and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated June 8, 2015. Ms. Pearce seconded the motion with the addition of having windows come back to staff. Mr. Thompson agreed to the addition.

With the motion having been made it passed 8-0.

Item 15:

Consideration of Partial Demolition (Principal), Addition, and New Construction (Accessory) at 104 Lewisburg Ave.; Scott Robinson, Applicant.

Ms. Hall stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for a series of work at 104 Lewisburg Ave. and the proposed scope of work is as follows:

- Demolition of a non-historic addition at the rear of the house;
- Construction of an approx. 823 sq. ft. footprint two-story addition with covered porch at the rear in place of the addition proposed to be demolished;
- Construction of a 998 sq. ft. footprint, 1 ½-story accessory garage behind and to the side of the house.

Ms. Hall stated the applicant appeared before the Design Review Committee (DRC) to discuss the proposal at its May 18, 2015 meeting. Ms. Hall stated Staff recommends approval with conditions of the proposed partial demolition of the principal structure and the construction of the garage with the following:

- As a condition of approval, all windows must be wood in material and of a historically appropriate profile and dimension. Window specifications must be submitted to the Preservation Planner for review and approval prior to issuance of a building permit.
- As a condition of approval, the garage doors must be submitted to the Preservation Planner for review and approval prior to issuance of a building permit.
- The application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a building permit. Any additional changes and/or proposed changes to HZC-approved plans must be returned to the HZC for review and approval. Any additional changes to HZC-approved plans must be returned to the HZC for review and approval. All approved exterior demolition is limited to what is indicated on the application plan set. Any demolition that may compromise the exterior materials, details, or forms of the existing residence must be reviewed and approved by the HZC prior to work proceeding.
 - Foundation height surveys may be required at the time of building permit review to ensure compatibility with the height and massing conditions set forth within the project's corresponding Certificate of Appropriateness.
 - A scaled set of all elevations notating the following must be submitted to the Preservation Planner prior to issuance of a building permit:
 - all approved building materials, including foundation material and lap reveal; and
 - the overall height of the any new construction areas in relation to its existing residence's overall height and eave heights.

Ms. Hall stated Staff recommends denial of the proposed principal structure addition with the following:

- The footprint of the proposed enclosed addition is approximately 63% of the historic structure (discounting areas proposed for demolition), which is consistent with the *Guidelines*. The

Guidelines recommend limiting the square footage of addition to no more than half of the square footage of the footprint of the original building (p.52, #3).

- If approved, the application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a building permit. Any additional changes and/or proposed changes to HZC-approved plans must be returned to the HZC for review and approval. Any additional changes to HZC-approved plans must be returned to the HZC for review and approval. All approved exterior demolition is limited to what is indicated on the application plan set. Any demolition that may compromise the exterior materials, details, or forms of the existing residence must be reviewed and approved by the HZC prior to work proceeding.

Mr. Coffey stated agreed with staff that the current addition was a second addition to the house from the 80s and not very attractive. Mr. Coffey stated the change in level is really too many steps to be made functionally accessible from the house. Mr. Coffey stated they are proposing raising the floor level. Mr. Coffey explained the coverage amount.

Chairwoman Besser requested to know if there were any citizens who wished to comment, and no one requested to speak.

Mr. Womack moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #5855 for the partial demolition of the principal structure and the construction of the garage with staff's comments, in accordance with the *Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines* and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated June 8, 2015. Ms. Marquardt seconded the motion, and the motion passed 6-2, with Mr. Roberts and Ms. Reynolds voting no.

Discussion ensued.

Ms. Reynolds moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission deny issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #5855 for the construction of the addition with staff's comments, in accordance with the *Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines* and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated June 8, 2015. Ms. Marquardt seconded the motion, and the motion passed 6-2, with Ms. Pearce and Mr. Womack voting no.

Item 16:

Items Approved by the Preservation Planner on Behalf of the Historic Zoning Commission, pursuant to the *Historic District Design Guidelines*

- **Fencing at 723 Fair St.; Tony & Lynne McAlister, Applicants.**
- **Wall at 810 W. Main St.; Jondie Davis, Applicant.**

Item 17:

Other Business.

No other business.

Item 18:

Adjourn.

With no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 7:48 p.m.