




HISTORIC
FRANKLIN
TENNESSEE

ITEM #6
WRKS
04/08/14

MEMORANDUM

March 31, 2014

TO: Board of Mayor and Aldermen

FROM: Eric S. Stuckey, City Administrator 
Russell Truell, Assistant City Administrator / CFO
Rocky Garzarek, Fire Chief
Todd Horton, Assistant Fire Chief
Brian Wilcox, Purchasing Manager

SUBJECT: Consider recommendation to reject all proposals for physical medical exam services for personnel of the Fire Department (Purchasing Office Procurement Solicitation No. 2014-018)

Purpose

The purpose of this procurement would be to purchase routine physical medical exam services for fire suppression personnel of the Fire Department.

Background

Currently, the Fire Department sends its fire suppression personnel offsite for routine physical medical exams. At the department's request, the City solicited proposals from qualified service providers to perform:

- Firefighter annual physical health examinations, to be conducted at one or more Franklin Fire Department facilities.
 - For personnel on duty at the time of the scheduled examinations, the City's goal is to contract for these examinations without the need to subcontract any portion thereof.
 - For personnel not on duty at the time of the scheduled examinations, the City's expectation is for the primary service provider, if not routinely available to provide the required services in Franklin, to subcontract for these examinations.
- Mitigating Post Event Management. The service provider will coordinate follow up clearances and mitigate medical clearance issues for both on and off the job injury and illness as required and at no additional cost to the City.

As stated in the request for proposals:

The department has been receiving physical examinations for many years, with the most recent being conducted at a facility that is approximately 11 miles away and located outside of Franklin city limits. This location has limited Franklin Fire to three (3) personnel per visit and has incurred costs including fuel, wear and tear on vehicles, and time for employees away from work. Franklin Fire has found that it has taken nearly 45 days to complete all necessary physicals. Our goal is to streamline this process enabling all firefighter examinations to be administered within a timeframe of not more than two (2) weeks.

It should be noted that an addendum to the request for proposals stated as follows:

The intent of the solicitation is to have all annual physicals provided on City premises. However, proposals for alternative service delivery methods will be considered. Any proposals for alternative service delivery methods must be explained in detail sufficient for the City to evaluate its merits and practicality.



HISTORIC
FRANKLIN
TENNESSEE

MEMORANDUM

The City published on January 30, 2014 a Notice to Proposers in the *Williamson Herald* for physical medical exam services for Franklin Fire Department personnel. In addition, solicitation documents were sent on or about the same date directly to eight (8) service providers known or thought to be interested in this solicitation. Proposals from three (3) service providers were publicly opened at the submittal opening held on March 13, 2014. A tabulation of the proposals received for this solicitation is attached.

Each of the three proposals received has material deficiencies and is therefore not responsive to the request for proposals. The deficiencies are identified on the tabulation, in the "exceptions" column. Discussion of the deficiencies follows:

- The Lifesigns proposal contemplates services for on-duty personnel to be provided offsite. Although the City, in the context of Addendum No. 1, did entertain the possibility of not having all annual physicals provided on City premises, the Lifesigns location and proposal for offsite services would not permit the City to achieve in a cost-effective manner (because of the value of time required to send personnel offsite) its stated goal of "enabling all firefighter examinations to be administered within a timeframe of not more than two (2) weeks."
- The Professional Health Services proposal does not include fitness assessments for personnel not on-duty at the time onsite services are rendered, resulting in an incomplete proposed scope of services.
- The SiteMed proposal is conditioned on minimum quantities despite a provision in the request for proposals that states, "The estimated quantities [provided by the City] are merely projections and do not represent a guaranteed minimum or maximum volume of services to be rendered in any year." Further, the SiteMed proposal does not include mammograms and does not provide services for personnel not on-duty at the time onsite services are rendered, resulting in an incomplete proposed scope of services.

Financial Impact

The financial impact of the proposals received is not being evaluated at this time due to the deficiencies noted above.

Options

In accordance with the solicitation documents, the City reserves the right to reject any and all proposals.

Recommendation

Staff recommends that the City reject all proposals, continue for the time being to utilize the services of the current service provider, and prepare and issue a new request for proposals for a revised scope of services to be rendered in City fiscal year 2015 and possibly beyond. Purchasing Manager Brian Wilcox is of the opinion that the prepared solicitation documents as distributed allowed for competition among multiple service providers, and that the staff recommendation appears to be made in a fair and impartial manner based upon the proposals received.

Tabulation of Submittals*

Purchasing Office Solicitation No.:		2014-018 (physical medical exam services for Fire Department personnel)			
Notice to proposers published in the Williamson Herald on:		1/30/14			
Number of potential proposers that were notified of / that submitted a proposal in response to this request for proposals:		8 / 3			
Date and time proposal due and publicly opened:		3/13/14 2:00 PM			
Present at opening of proposals:		Dee Settle, Suzanne Ward and Brian Wilcox of the City of Franklin Purchasing			
Target meeting of BOMA at which recommendation will be considered:		4/22/14			
Proposals received from:	Does the proposal include all required documents?	Does the proposer take any exceptions to the City's procurement solicitation? / If so, how many?	Average points allocated by proposal evaluation team (out of a possible 100, utilizing evaluation criteria as listed in RFP):	Payment terms:	Proposal is valid and may be accepted through:
Lifesigns 105 Westwood Place, Suite 350 Brentwood, TN 37027 Allison Elsten, Director of Center Operations 615/371-3000 aelsten@preventiongroup.com	Yes	Proposer takes no exceptions (CoF notes services for on-duty personnel to be provided offsite)	not computed	net 30 days	4/22/2014
Professional Health Services, Inc. 83 South Eagle Rd. Havertown, PA 19083 David Hartman, Sales Manager 610/853-1330, ext. 156 dhartman@phsmobile.com	Yes	Proposer takes no exceptions (CoF notes pricing does not include fitness assessments for off-duty personnel)	unable to compute	net 30 days	9/31/2014
SiteMed North America LLC 112 Donmoor Ct. Garner, NC 27529 Vanessa Flores, COO 919/661-3779 vflores@sitemed.net	Yes	Proposer takes no exceptions (CoF notes pricing is conditioned on minimum quantities, does not include mammograms, and does not provide services for off-duty personnel)	unable to compute	net 30 days	6/1/2014

*Staff recommends all proposals be rejected