



MEMORANDUM

March 15, 2013

TO: Board of Mayor and Aldermen

FROM: Eric S. Stuckey, City Administrator
Russell Truell, Assistant City Administrator / CFO
Mark Hilty, Water Management Director
Brian Wilcox, Purchasing Manager

SUBJECT: Consideration of bid award to Brenntag Mid-South, Inc. of Henderson, KY in the estimated amount of \$9,000 per year for the supply and delivery upon demand of the water treatment chemical hydrofluosilicic acid (fluoride) for a minimum of twelve (12) months for the Water Treatment Division of the Water Management Department (Purchasing Office Procurement Solicitation No. 2013-012; \$155,000 budgeted in 421-83220-52103 for all chemicals and lab supplies for fiscal year 2013; Contract No. 2013-0025)

Purpose

The purpose of this procurement is to price on a per unit basis the purchase upon demand for a minimum of twelve (12) months the supply and delivery to the City of Franklin Water Treatment Facility the water treatment chemical hydrofluosilicic acid (fluoride). This chemical is routinely used by the City in the water treatment process.

Background

The City published on February 21, 2013 a Notice to Bidders in the *Williamson Herald* for supply and delivery upon demand of each of the following five (5) water treatment chemicals for a minimum of twelve (12) months: (a) sodium hypochlorite (2013-010), (b) sodium permanganate (2013-011), (c) hydrofluosilicic acid (fluoride) (2013-012), (d) powder-activated carbon (hydrodarco B) (2013-013), and (e) polyaluminum chloride (PAC) (2013-014); each being bid independently. In addition, bid documents were sent on or about the same date directly to nineteen (19) potential bidders known or thought to be interested in this solicitation. Bids from six (6) vendors were publicly opened at the bid opening held on March 12, 2013. A tabulation of the bids received for this solicitation is attached.

Financial Impact

The apparent lowest, most responsive and responsible bid, from Brenntag Mid-South, Inc. of Henderson, KY is in the amount of \$0.40 per pound. For the specified estimated quantity of 22,500 pounds per year, the total delivered bid price for the specified estimated quantity would be \$9,000 per year. This bid was identified because it is the lowest bid that meets or exceeds the City's intention as expressed and implied by the City's specifications as well as the instructions, terms and conditions pertaining to this procurement solicitation. The Water Management Department Water Treatment Division budget for fiscal year 2013 allocates \$155,000 out of the Water Fund for the purchase of chemicals and lab supplies. On a per pound basis, the Brenntag Mid-South bid amount is \$0.25 (38%) less than what the City is currently paying.

Options

In accordance with the bid documents, the City reserves the right to reject any and all bids.

Recommendation

Staff recommends that the City accept the apparent lowest best bid, from Brenntag Mid-South, Inc. of Henderson, KY in the amount of \$0.40 per pound. Purchasing Manager Brian Wilcox is of the opinion that the prepared specifications as distributed allowed for competition among multiple vendors, and that the staff recommendation appears to be made in a fair and impartial manner based upon the bids received.

City of Franklin, Tennessee
Tabulation of Bids*

Purchasing Office Solicitation No.:		2013-012 (hydrofluosilicic acid (fluoride))																																																																																					
Notice to Bidders published in the <i>Williamson Herald</i> on:		2/21/13																																																																																					
Number of vendors that were notified of / that responded to this solicitation for bids:		19 / 6																																																																																					
Date and time bids due and publicly opened:		3/12/13 2:00 PM																																																																																					
Present at opening of bids:		Bryan Holt of Greenway Products, Mike Wetherington of American Development and Drew Herzog of Harcros Chemicals; Russell Sullivan and Larry McClure of the City of Franklin Water Management Department; and Suzanne Ward, Dee Settle and Brian Wilcox of the City of Franklin Purchasing Office																																																																																					
Target meeting of BOMA at which recommendation will be considered:		4/9/13																																																																																					
<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Bids received from:</th> <th>Bid No.:</th> <th>Chemical:</th> <th>Does the bid MOES¹? / If not, how many exceptions do not MOES¹?</th> <th>Total quoted unit price per pound:</th> <th>Total quoted unit price per U.S. gallon:</th> <th>Specified estimated quantity for 12-month period (pounds):</th> <th>Total delivered bid price for specified estimated quantity for 12-month period:</th> <th>Delivery terms / Payment terms:</th> <th>Estimated time of delivery after receipt of order:</th> <th>Bid price per unit is valid through:</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>American Development Corp. 821 William D. Jones Blvd. P.O. Box 620 Fayetteville, TN 37334 Mike Wetherington, CEO 888/542-8561 mikew@adc-chem.com</td> <td>1 of 1</td> <td>hydro-fluosilicic acid (fluoride)</td> <td>Bidder takes no exceptions</td> <td>\$0.4200</td> <td>\$4.360</td> <td>22,500</td> <td>\$9,450.00</td> <td>FOB destination, freight prepaid / net 30 days</td> <td>2 days</td> <td>08/30/13</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Brenntag Mid-South, Inc. 1405 Hwy. 136 W. P.O. Box 20 Henderson, KY 42420 Josh Waggener, Branch Manager 270/830-1312 jwaggener@brenntag.com</td> <td>1 of 1</td> <td>hydro-fluosilicic acid (fluoride)</td> <td>Bidder takes no exceptions</td> <td>\$0.4000</td> <td>\$4.112</td> <td>22,500</td> <td>\$9,000.00</td> <td>FOB destination, freight prepaid / net 30 days</td> <td>2-3 days</td> <td>04/30/13</td> </tr> <tr> <td>The C.I. Thornburg Co., Inc. 3333 Hydes Ferry Rd. Nashville, TN 37278 Phil Porter, Branch Manager 615/254-3484 phil.porter@cithornburg.com</td> <td>1 of 1</td> <td>hydro-fluosilicic acid (fluoride)</td> <td>Bidder takes no exceptions</td> <td>\$0.5500</td> <td>\$6.050</td> <td>22,500</td> <td>\$12,375.00</td> <td>FOB destination, freight prepaid / net 30 days</td> <td>3-5 days</td> <td>01/01/14</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Greenway Products, Inc. 4320 Greenway Dr. Knoxville, TN 37918 Bryan Holt, Account Manager 800/258-5829, ext. 814 bholt@greenwayproductsinc.com</td> <td>1 of 1</td> <td>hydro-fluosilicic acid (fluoride)</td> <td>Bidder takes no exceptions</td> <td>\$0.5400</td> <td>not quoted</td> <td>22,500</td> <td>\$12,150.00</td> <td>FOB destination, freight prepaid / net 30 days</td> <td>3-4 days</td> <td>04/30/13</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Harcros Chemicals, Inc. 1418 Poplar Lane P.O. Box 101484 Nashville, TN 37224 Thomas Tune, District Manager 615/256-8636 ptune@harcros.com</td> <td>1 of 1</td> <td>hydro-fluosilicic acid (fluoride)</td> <td>Bidder takes exception to the delivery container. City understands bid to MOES. Bidder takes exception to the City's Indemnification Agreement.</td> <td>\$0.4900</td> <td>not quoted</td> <td>22,500</td> <td>\$11,025.00</td> <td>FOB destination, freight prepaid / net 30 days</td> <td>3-5 days</td> <td>04/30/13</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Univar USA, Inc. 4 Steel Rd. East Morrisville, PA 19067 Linda Campbell, Municipal Bid Specialist 215/428-6444 linda.campbell@univarusa.com</td> <td>1 of 1</td> <td>hydro-fluosilicic acid (fluoride)</td> <td>Bidder takes no exceptions</td> <td>\$0.6997</td> <td>\$7.067</td> <td>22,500</td> <td>\$15,743.25</td> <td>FOB destination, freight prepaid / net 30 days</td> <td>2-3 working days</td> <td>04/30/13</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>											Bids received from:	Bid No.:	Chemical:	Does the bid MOES ¹ ? / If not, how many exceptions do not MOES ¹ ?	Total quoted unit price per pound:	Total quoted unit price per U.S. gallon:	Specified estimated quantity for 12-month period (pounds):	Total delivered bid price for specified estimated quantity for 12-month period:	Delivery terms / Payment terms:	Estimated time of delivery after receipt of order:	Bid price per unit is valid through:	American Development Corp. 821 William D. Jones Blvd. P.O. Box 620 Fayetteville, TN 37334 Mike Wetherington, CEO 888/542-8561 mikew@adc-chem.com	1 of 1	hydro-fluosilicic acid (fluoride)	Bidder takes no exceptions	\$0.4200	\$4.360	22,500	\$9,450.00	FOB destination, freight prepaid / net 30 days	2 days	08/30/13	Brenntag Mid-South, Inc. 1405 Hwy. 136 W. P.O. Box 20 Henderson, KY 42420 Josh Waggener, Branch Manager 270/830-1312 jwaggener@brenntag.com	1 of 1	hydro-fluosilicic acid (fluoride)	Bidder takes no exceptions	\$0.4000	\$4.112	22,500	\$9,000.00	FOB destination, freight prepaid / net 30 days	2-3 days	04/30/13	The C.I. Thornburg Co., Inc. 3333 Hydes Ferry Rd. Nashville, TN 37278 Phil Porter, Branch Manager 615/254-3484 phil.porter@cithornburg.com	1 of 1	hydro-fluosilicic acid (fluoride)	Bidder takes no exceptions	\$0.5500	\$6.050	22,500	\$12,375.00	FOB destination, freight prepaid / net 30 days	3-5 days	01/01/14	Greenway Products, Inc. 4320 Greenway Dr. Knoxville, TN 37918 Bryan Holt, Account Manager 800/258-5829, ext. 814 bholt@greenwayproductsinc.com	1 of 1	hydro-fluosilicic acid (fluoride)	Bidder takes no exceptions	\$0.5400	not quoted	22,500	\$12,150.00	FOB destination, freight prepaid / net 30 days	3-4 days	04/30/13	Harcros Chemicals, Inc. 1418 Poplar Lane P.O. Box 101484 Nashville, TN 37224 Thomas Tune, District Manager 615/256-8636 ptune@harcros.com	1 of 1	hydro-fluosilicic acid (fluoride)	Bidder takes exception to the delivery container. City understands bid to MOES. Bidder takes exception to the City's Indemnification Agreement.	\$0.4900	not quoted	22,500	\$11,025.00	FOB destination, freight prepaid / net 30 days	3-5 days	04/30/13	Univar USA, Inc. 4 Steel Rd. East Morrisville, PA 19067 Linda Campbell, Municipal Bid Specialist 215/428-6444 linda.campbell@univarusa.com	1 of 1	hydro-fluosilicic acid (fluoride)	Bidder takes no exceptions	\$0.6997	\$7.067	22,500	\$15,743.25	FOB destination, freight prepaid / net 30 days	2-3 working days	04/30/13
Bids received from:	Bid No.:	Chemical:	Does the bid MOES ¹ ? / If not, how many exceptions do not MOES ¹ ?	Total quoted unit price per pound:	Total quoted unit price per U.S. gallon:	Specified estimated quantity for 12-month period (pounds):	Total delivered bid price for specified estimated quantity for 12-month period:	Delivery terms / Payment terms:	Estimated time of delivery after receipt of order:	Bid price per unit is valid through:																																																																													
American Development Corp. 821 William D. Jones Blvd. P.O. Box 620 Fayetteville, TN 37334 Mike Wetherington, CEO 888/542-8561 mikew@adc-chem.com	1 of 1	hydro-fluosilicic acid (fluoride)	Bidder takes no exceptions	\$0.4200	\$4.360	22,500	\$9,450.00	FOB destination, freight prepaid / net 30 days	2 days	08/30/13																																																																													
Brenntag Mid-South, Inc. 1405 Hwy. 136 W. P.O. Box 20 Henderson, KY 42420 Josh Waggener, Branch Manager 270/830-1312 jwaggener@brenntag.com	1 of 1	hydro-fluosilicic acid (fluoride)	Bidder takes no exceptions	\$0.4000	\$4.112	22,500	\$9,000.00	FOB destination, freight prepaid / net 30 days	2-3 days	04/30/13																																																																													
The C.I. Thornburg Co., Inc. 3333 Hydes Ferry Rd. Nashville, TN 37278 Phil Porter, Branch Manager 615/254-3484 phil.porter@cithornburg.com	1 of 1	hydro-fluosilicic acid (fluoride)	Bidder takes no exceptions	\$0.5500	\$6.050	22,500	\$12,375.00	FOB destination, freight prepaid / net 30 days	3-5 days	01/01/14																																																																													
Greenway Products, Inc. 4320 Greenway Dr. Knoxville, TN 37918 Bryan Holt, Account Manager 800/258-5829, ext. 814 bholt@greenwayproductsinc.com	1 of 1	hydro-fluosilicic acid (fluoride)	Bidder takes no exceptions	\$0.5400	not quoted	22,500	\$12,150.00	FOB destination, freight prepaid / net 30 days	3-4 days	04/30/13																																																																													
Harcros Chemicals, Inc. 1418 Poplar Lane P.O. Box 101484 Nashville, TN 37224 Thomas Tune, District Manager 615/256-8636 ptune@harcros.com	1 of 1	hydro-fluosilicic acid (fluoride)	Bidder takes exception to the delivery container. City understands bid to MOES. Bidder takes exception to the City's Indemnification Agreement.	\$0.4900	not quoted	22,500	\$11,025.00	FOB destination, freight prepaid / net 30 days	3-5 days	04/30/13																																																																													
Univar USA, Inc. 4 Steel Rd. East Morrisville, PA 19067 Linda Campbell, Municipal Bid Specialist 215/428-6444 linda.campbell@univarusa.com	1 of 1	hydro-fluosilicic acid (fluoride)	Bidder takes no exceptions	\$0.6997	\$7.067	22,500	\$15,743.25	FOB destination, freight prepaid / net 30 days	2-3 working days	04/30/13																																																																													

¹MOES indicates "meet(s) or exceed(s) specifications"

*Shaded bid is apparent lowest best bid