



MEMORANDUM

July 2, 2012

TO: Board of Mayor and Aldermen

FROM: Eric Stuckey, City Administrator
Vernon Gerth, ACA Community and Economic Development
Lisa Clayton, Parks Director
Catherine Powers, Planning & Sustainability Director
Brad Wilson, Facilities Manager
Amanda Hall, Historic Preservation Planner

SUBJECT: Consideration of Bid Award to Stone Crest Construction LLC. in an amount not to exceed \$167,000 for the New Roof Installation and Porch Reconstruction of the Hayes House located at Harlinsdale Farm for the City of Franklin Parks Department located at 331 Franklin Road (COF 2012-0037)

Purpose

The purpose of this memorandum is to provide information to the Board of Mayor and Aldermen (BOMA) to consider the award of a contract for the new roof construction, gutter rework, and front porch reconstruction for City-owned property located at 331 Franklin Road (Harlinsdale Farms) to Stone Crest Construction LLC in an amount not to exceed \$167,000.

Background

In May 2011, the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission (HZC) expressed concern regarding the state of the Hayes House at the City of Franklin's Park at Harlinsdale Farm and the 8-year timeline for its restoration, as referenced in the overall park master plan. Over the past several years, the home has continued to sustain damage due to weather events causing water to enter the structure as a result of a damaged gutter and roof system. Staff received direction from the HZC to determine what the cost would be to stabilize the house and prevent further deterioration. Initial discussions revolved around a temporary stabilization plan for the roof and gutter system that would eventually need to be addressed as a permanent solution, as the commission suggested that the Queen Anne boxed gutter system was integral to the architectural fabric of the home and should be maintained.

A task force created by city staff and composed of contractor representatives as suggested by the Parks Department inspected the building and the City developed bid specifications for the project. After inspection of the project and the addition of \$20,000 grant funding from the Tennessee Historical Commission, however, the project proposal took on a more permanent solution.

An architectural firm, Crossroads Architecture, with expertise in preservation and the renovation of historic buildings, was selected to work on the detailed plans and specifications so bids could be obtained. The current gutter system was repaired many years ago by overlaying the gutters with a tar/felt type material. Over the years, holes have developed allowing water to seep into the walls of the building. The entire gutter, fascia, freeze and soffit framing systems are to be replaced around the home due to rot conditions. The current roofing materials will be removed down to the wood structure where a new decking will be installed for the reinstallation of shingles and flashing systems. The current chimneys will remain and the mortar joints will be repaired and the chimneys will be sealed and capped. The internal gutter system will remain and a newer longer lasting system will be installed to help with the Parks Department's maintenance of the facility.



It was determined that the front porch was in disrepair and needed to be updated for both structural and safety concerns. The porch foundation system is falling apart and the porch is being held up by a few blocks and miscellaneous posts. The floor decking is rotting out and the ceiling system is falling in due to water damage. The porch will be completely reworked with new foundation piers to match the original brick piers along with flooring and framing of the porch. The current detailed columns will be reused along with other detailed wood pieces that are currently found on the porch. The porch roof will also be replaced with a new metal roof to match the current look already associated with the exterior façade.

On May 2, 2012 an advertisement was sent out seeking bids for the repairs to the roofing, gutters, and front porch areas for the Hayes House, located in the City of Franklin's Park at Harlinsdale Farm. On May 18, 2012, bids were received for the rework to the roof and front porch system located at the Hayes House at Harlinsdale Farm. Staff publicly opened bids submitted by contractors for the work detailed in the drawings and specifications that were produced by Crossroads Architecture. Stone Crest was not the low bidder but the second-to-lowest bidder. Following a complete review of the bids, staff's recommendation is to enter into an agreement with Stone Crest Construction LLC as the apparent low bidder's submittal was incomplete regarding requested alternates. The second bidder, Stone Crest Construction LLC, bid the amount not to exceed \$167,000. Staff also recommended an owner's contingency separately from the contract in the amount of \$15,000 for any unforeseen problems with the project. The original projected budget determined prior to the bid was \$185,000 regarding all of the work included in the bid.

Historic Zoning Commission

The Franklin Historic Zoning Commission (HZC) was at the forefront of the need to preserve the Hayes House and began discussing the condition of the house in early 2011. In total, the City Facilities Manager and/or the City Parks Director has appeared before the HZC eight times from July 2011 to June 2012 to provide reports and seek suggestions from the commission in regard to the Hayes House porch, gutter system, and roofing project. Most recently, at its June 18th Special Meeting, the HZC approved a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project's work specifications, including the colors of the asphalt shingle roofing and standing seam metal roofing, the replication of the porch, and the use of copper gutters for the boxed gutter system (with recommendation that sixteen ounce copper be consideration in lieu of an eight ounce copper).

On June 21, 2012, concerns were raised at the BOMA Work Session related to some of the materials being used and the recommended contractor for this project. Since the issue has been presented, staff would like to reply in regard to the expertise of the architect and contractor as well as the integrity of the materials selected.

Architect: Crossroads Architecture

The following is a list of qualifications and past projects related to historic preservation.

- Graduated from the University of Cincinnati
- Served as Staff Architect for Metro Historical Commission
- Co-authored a grant for the stabilization of the U.S. Customs House at Broadway and 8th Avenue, Nashville
- Designed the renovation of the Silver Dollar Saloon in Nashville from tavern to offices for the Metro Historical Commission
- Won three Heritage Foundation design awards
- Taught at O'More College of Design and Nashville Tech as architectural director

The primary concern expressed at the June 21 work session was the expertise of the selected contractor in renovation of historic structures.



Contractor: Stone Crest Construction

The contractor is a licensed State of Tennessee contractor. While this contractor has not done anything in Franklin related to historic buildings, the contractor does have experience in historic renovation in Middle Tennessee.

- The Hampton, Mt. Pleasant, Tennessee—did extensive renovation
- Lipscomb Place, 1836, Cross Bridge, Tennessee—interior and exterior work
- Himes Home, 1880, Culleoka, Tennessee—complete remodel
- Davis Home, 1890, Mt. Pleasant, Tennessee—foundation reconstruction and complete remodel

Materials

The other issue concern expressed relates to the material selection for the project, specific to the quality of the materials selected and the longevity of the roof and gutters as presented. The primary concerns discussed were the roofing and the copper gutters.

- Roofing—Brad Wilson, Facilities Manager, has researched the question of roofing with Mr. George Tucker, commercial/residential roofing territorial manager for CertainTeed (the manufacturer of the roofing shingles staff is proposing to use) regarding the specification for the roof. Mr. Tucker reviewed the plans specifications and stated the following: “The drawings are in order and include the components to make a good roof system...The architect has included ice and water membrane for the low 3/12 pitch areas...that is a must. You have to cover all these areas in the low pitch with waterproof underlayment adhered to the roof deck. Everything looks good from the drawings.”
- Copper gutters—There was concern expressed that metal and copper would come into contact with one another. This is not possible, however, since the gutters, top of the soffit box, and the downspouts are all copper.

Staff believes both the architect and contractor have the background and experience to complete this project in a timely and workmanlike manner, and that the materials are appropriate for this project and will be durable.

Conclusion

As this summary shows, the Historic Zoning Commission has been involved throughout this process pursuant to its authority and believes the vote of June 18, 2012 is adequate to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness. Additionally, in discussion with the project architect and experts in the roofing field, staff believes this project to be more than adequate to address the needs of the Hayes House.

Financial Impact

By approving this contract the City would be responsible for paying \$167,000 once the improvements are completed. This project is funded through the Hotel/Motel Tax Fund. The project budget is \$185,000.

The City currently has a grant contract with the Tennessee Historical Commission that will fund \$20,000 toward the roof portion of the project. A grant amendment is currently proposed to the BOMA that would provide another \$40,000 toward the roof replacement and gutter rehabilitation. Under the grant, the project must be completed by September 30, 2012.

Recommendation

Approval of the contract with Stone Crest Construction LLC with an amount not to exceed \$167,000, including a \$15,000 owner’s contingency is recommended.

Tabulation of Bids *

Purchasing Office Solicitation No.:	2012-0037 Reroof and reconstruction of gutter system and porch of Hayes House at Harlinsdale Farm
Notice to Bidders published in the Tennessean on:	Sunday May 6,2012
Number of vendors that were notified of / that responded to this solicitation	2
Date and time bids due and publicly	May 18, 2012 2:00PM
Present at opening of bids:	Brent Young Stone Crest Construction LLC., Paul Varney, Paul Varney Construction, Chris Wyatt Crossroads Electric, Jonathan Marston COF Engineering, Brad Wilson COF
Target meeting of BOMA at which recommendation will be considered:	June 21st, 2012

Bids received from:	Base Bid Amount	Gutter Material Alternate Increase 1: Copper 2: Liq. EPDM 3: EPDM	Roofing Material Alternate Increase 1: 30 yr 2: 40 yr 3: 50 yr	Half Inch Plywood Replacement per sheet	1 x 6 Framing Replacement at Rafters per LF.	Staff Recommendation including items in RED for Base Price Incl. Alternates
Paul Varney Construction	\$146,100	\$0.00	\$1,176	\$43.00	\$3.78	
		\$0.00	\$2,646			
		\$0.00	\$3,822			
Stone Crest Construction LLC.	\$153,500	\$12,200	\$1,200	\$21.19	\$14.79	\$160,700
		\$6,000	\$4,060			
		\$6,800	\$5,680			

¹MOES indicates "meet(s) or exceed(s) specifications"

*Shaded bid is apparent lowest best bid