



HISTORIC  
FRANKLIN  
TENNESSEE

ITEM #25  
BOMA  
05/08/2012

## MEMORANDUM

April 16, 2012

**TO:** Board of Mayor and Aldermen

**FROM:** Eric S. Stuckey, City Administrator *ES*  
Russell Truell, Assistant City Administrator / CFO  
Shirley Harmon, Human Resources Director  
Tammie Pitts, Benefits Manager  
Brian Wilcox, Purchasing Manager

**SUBJECT:** Group employee insurance benefits (Purchasing Office Solicitation No. 2012-022)

### Purpose

The purpose of this procurement is to purchase the following group employee insurance benefits for an initial term of service of twelve (12) months, effective July 1, 2012 and through June 30, 2013, with options at the City's sole discretion to renew for like terms:

- A. health benefit management products and services;
- B. pharmacy benefit management products and services;
- C. dental and associated group employee insurance benefits;
- D. life, accidental death and dismemberment, and supplemental life group employee insurance benefits; and
- E. long-term disability group employee insurance benefits.

### Background

The City published on February 9, 2012 a Notice to Proposers in the *Williamson Herald* for the following five (5) separate and independent group employee insurance procurements: (a) health benefit program and associated services; (b) pharmacy benefit management; (c) dental benefit program and associated services; (d) group life, accidental death and dismemberment, and supplemental life; and (e) long-term disability. In addition, solicitation documents were sent on or about the same date directly to 33 potential proposers known or thought to be interested in this solicitation. Proposals from fourteen (14) vendors were publicly opened at the submittal opening held on March 12, 2012.

According to the Request for Proposals, "Respondents must be represented directly. Participation by brokers or commissioned agents will not be allowed during the proposal process or during the term of the proposed contract."

All responsive proposals were evaluated by the City's group employee insurance benefits consultant, the firm of Sherrill Morgan of Covington, KY, pursuant to the evaluation criteria listed in the Request for Proposals. In addition to the evaluation criteria for which points were allocated, fees and/or rates were also identified in the Request for Proposals as an important consideration. The following is a summary of the evaluation:

- Eight Health and Pharmacy Benefit Management (PBM) proposals were received. After scoring, the following six Health and PBM finalists were interviewed by COF representatives and Sherrill Morgan: Aetna; BlueCross BlueShield of Tennessee (BCBST); Connecticut General Life Insurance Company (Cigna); Consociate Dansig; HealthScope Benefits; and Medical Benefits Administrators, Inc. (MedBen). From the interviews, two finalists (BCBST and Cigna) were found to better meet the City's qualifications and had comparable provider networks and discounts. BCBST is the City's current third party administrator for the self-funded health and pharmacy benefit management coverage. The City and employees are pleased with the high level of service currently received by BCBST. The interview committee selected BlueCross BlueShield of Tennessee (BCBST), so staff's recommendation is to award BCBST with the Health and Pharmacy Benefit Management coverage effective July 1, 2012.



- Thirteen dental proposals were received. Delta Dental of Tennessee, the City’s current third party administrator for the self-funded dental plan, scored the highest number of points. Members have the benefit of choosing providers from two networks. The City and employees are pleased with the service currently provided. Staff’s recommendation is to award Delta Dental of TN with the dental coverage effective July 1, 2012.
- Five Basic Life, Accidental Death and Dismemberment (AD&D), and Supplemental Life Insurance proposals were received. In consideration of the response to the RFP, cost, and three-year rate guarantee, staff’s recommendation is to award Aetna with the basic life, accidental death and dismemberment, and supplemental life coverage effective July 1, 2012. It is worth noting that Aetna’s proposal included requested “legal deviations” (Aetna’s term) that staff will be reviewing discussing with Aetna in the process of preparing final documents for approval by the two parties.
- Three Long-Term Disability proposals were received. In consideration of the response to the RFP, cost, and three-year rate guarantee, staff’s recommendation is to award Aetna with the long-term disability coverage effective July 1, 2012. See note above about Aetna’s requested “legal deviations.”

Tabulations of the proposals received, one for each of the five categories of benefits identified by the Request for Proposals, as well as analysis prepared by the City’s group employee insurance benefits consultant, the firm of Sherrill Morgan, are attached.

**Financial Impact**

The services to be rendered pursuant to the request for proposals would be for an initial term of service of twelve (12) months, effective July 1, 2012 and through June 30, 2013, with options at the City’s sole discretion to renew for like terms. The rates quoted by the vendors awarded by the Board of Mayor and Aldermen the respective products and services will be factored into the City’s budget for the fiscal year beginning July 1, 2012.

**Options**

In accordance with the solicitation documents, the City reserves the right to reject any and all proposals.

**Recommendation**

Staff recommends that the City accept the following proposals for an initial term of service of twelve (12) months, effective July 1, 2012 and through June 30, 2013, with options at the City’s sole discretion to renew for like terms:

Service	Recommended proposer
Health benefit management and pharmacy benefit management products and services	BlueCross BlueShield of Tennessee of Chattanooga, TN
Dental and associated group employee insurance benefits	Delta Dental of Tennessee of Nashville, TN
Life, accidental death and dismemberment, supplemental life and long-term disability group employee insurance benefits	Aetna Life Insurance Company of Hartford, CT

Purchasing Manager Brian Wilcox is of the opinion that the prepared solicitation documents as distributed allowed for competition among multiple vendors, and that the staff recommendation appears to be made in a fair and impartial manner based upon the proposals received.

City of Franklin, Tennessee

**Tabulation of Proposals \***

<b>Purchasing Office Solicitation No.:</b> 2012-022 Group Employee Insurance Benefits:					
<b>C:</b> dental benefit program and associated services					
<b>Notice to Proposers published in the Williamson Herald on:</b>		2/9/12			
<b>Number of vendors that were notified of / that responded to this request for proposals:</b>		33 / 13			
<b>Date and time proposals due and publicly opened:</b>		3/12/12 at 2:00 p.m.			
<b>Present at opening of proposals:</b>		Scott Karner of Blue Cross Blue Shield of TN; Shirley Harmon, Tammie Pitts and Tracy Harness of the City of Franklin Human Resources Department; and Tiffany Wilkins and Brian Wilcox of			
<b>Target meeting of BOMA at which recommendation will be considered:</b>		5/8/12			
<b>Proposals received from:</b>	<b>Description of proposal:</b>	<b>Does the proposal take any exceptions to the RFP?</b>	<b>Points allocated pursuant to the evaluation criteria listed in the request for proposals:</b>	<b>Payment terms:</b>	<b>Proposal price per unit is valid through:</b>
Advantica 19321-C US Highway 19 North, Suite 320 Clearwater, FL 33764-3141 Terri Hoedebeck, VP of Business Development 618-781-6770	C	No exceptions taken	93	net 30 days	07/01/12
Aetna Life Insurance Company 151 Farmington Avenue Hartford, CT 06156 Kevin Ryan, Senior Sales Executive 615-322-1600	C	Yes, "legal deviations" requested	83	net 30 days	06/30/12
BAS, LLC. 17475 Jovanna Drive Homewood, IL 60430 Justin Forton, Sales Executive 615-720-7773	C	No exceptions taken	88	net 15 days	06/30/12
BlueCross BlueShield of Tennessee 1 Cameron Hill Circle Chattanooga, TN 37402 Scott Karner, Account Executive 615-386-8555	C	No exceptions taken	88	net 30 days	06/30/12
Connecticut General Life Insurance Company (CGLIC) 900 Cottage Grove Road Bloomfield, CT 06152 Ryan Kocher, Senior Sales Representative 423-763-6680	C	Yes, exceptions taken	90	net 30 days	06/30/12
Consociate, Inc. 321 Billingsly Court, Suite 5 Franklin, TN 37067 David Reynolds, Vice President 615-771-3534	C	No exceptions taken	66	net 30 days	06/30/12

<sup>1</sup>MOES indicates "meet(s) or exceed(s) specifications"

\* Shaded proposal is the proposal found by the proposal evaluation team to best meets the needs of the City

**Tabulation of Proposals**\*

<b>Purchasing Office Solicitation No.:</b> 2012-022 Group Employee Insurance Benefits:					
<b>C:</b> dental benefit program and associated services					
<b>Notice to Proposers published in the Williamson Herald on:</b>		2/9/12			
<b>Number of vendors that were notified of / that responded to this request for proposals:</b>		33 / 13			
<b>Date and time proposals due and publicly opened:</b>		3/12/12 at 2:00 p.m.			
<b>Present at opening of proposals:</b>		Scott Karner of Blue Cross Blue Shield of TN; Shirley Harmon, Tammie Pitts and Tracy Harness of the City of Franklin Human Resources Department; and Tiffany Wilkins and Brian Wilcox of			
<b>Target meeting of BOMA at which recommendation will be considered:</b>		5/8/12			
<b>Proposals received from:</b>					
	<b>Description of proposal:</b>	<b>Does the proposal take any exceptions to the RFP?</b>	<b>Points allocated pursuant to the evaluation criteria listed in the request for proposals:</b>	<b>Payment terms:</b>	<b>Proposal price per unit is valid through:</b>
	Delta Dental of Tennessee 240 Venture Circle Nashville, TN 37228 Brett Oaks, Senior Account Executive 615-742-6902	C	No exceptions taken	100 net 30 days	07/01/12
	Guardian Life Insurance Company of America 4555 Lake Forest Drive, Suit 520 Cincinnati, OH 45242 Scott Cooper, Key Account Representative 513-719-4438	C	Yes, "exceptions" taken	60 net 30 days	09/15/12
	HealthSCOPE Benefits 27 Corporate Hill Drive Little Rock, AR 72205 Mary Catherine Person, President 501-218-7513	C	No exceptions taken	85 net 30 days	06/30/12
	Medical Benefits Administrators, Inc. 1975 Tamarack Road Newark, OH 43058-1009 Blair Pickerill, Regional Sales Vice President 502-896-2210	C	No exceptions taken	95 net 30 days	6/30/2012
	Metropolitan Life Insurance Company 312 Elm Street, Suite 1475 Cincinnati, OH 45202 Bryan K. Schapman, Account Executive 513-826-4824	C	Yes, "deviations" requested	70 net 30 days	6/30/2012
	North America Administrators, L.P. 1826 Elm Hill Pike Nashville, TN 37210 Bruce Thompson, Vice President of Sales 800-411-3650 ext. 169	C	No exceptions taken	66 net 20 days from date of invoice	06/30/12

<sup>1</sup>MOES indicates "meet(s) or exceed(s) specifications"

\*Shaded proposal is the proposal found by the proposal evaluation team to best meets the needs of the City

**Tabulation of Proposals**\*

<b>Purchasing Office Solicitation No.:</b>		<b>2012-022 Group Employee Insurance Benefits:</b>			
<b>C:</b>		<b>dental benefit program and associated services</b>			
<b>Notice to Proposers published in the Williamson Herald on:</b>		2/9/12			
<b>Number of vendors that were notified of / that responded to this request for proposals:</b>		33 / 13			
<b>Date and time proposals due and publicly opened:</b>		3/12/12 at 2:00 p.m.			
<b>Present at opening of proposals:</b>		Scott Karner of Blue Cross Blue Shield of TN; Shirley Harmon, Tammie Pitts and Tracy Harness of the City of Franklin Human Resources Department; and Tiffany Wilkins and Brian Wilcox of			
<b>Target meeting of BOMA at which recommendation will be considered:</b>		5/8/12			
<b>Proposals received from:</b>	<b>Description of proposal:</b>	<b>Does the proposal take any exceptions to the RFP?</b>	<b>Points allocated pursuant to the evaluation criteria listed in the request for proposals:</b>	<b>Payment terms:</b>	<b>Proposal price per unit is valid through:</b>
Reliance Standard 4555 Lake Forest Drive Cincinnati, OH 45242 Erin Wloszek, Sales Representative 513-265-4179	C	No exceptions taken	63	net 30 days	07/01/12

<sup>1</sup>MOES indicates "meet(s) or exceed(s) specifications"

\*Shaded proposal is the proposal found by the proposal evaluation team to best meets the needs of the City

# City of Franklin

## Financial Summary Dental

Based on 616 employees

Company	Delta Dental	Healthscope	Advantica*	NAA*	MedBen*	Guardian
Base Admin. Fee	3.56	\$2.50	\$4.05	\$1.65	\$2.00	\$4.13
COBRA Admin. Fee		\$1.10		\$0.25	\$1.95	
HIPAA Admin. Fee						
Dental PPO Admin./Coordination Fee					\$0.75	
Dental PPO Access Fee		\$0.85			\$0.95	
Run-in Fee PEPM		\$0.50				
Other Monthly Fees						
Total Monthly Fees	3.56	\$4.95	\$4.05	\$1.90	\$5.65	\$4.13
Annual Fees (if applicable)						
Run-In Fee Group					\$1,232.00	
One-Time Set-Up Fees (if applicable)					\$1,750.00	
<b>TOTAL ANNUAL FEES</b>	<b>26,315.52</b>	<b>36,590.40</b>	<b>\$29,937.60</b>	<b>\$14,044.80</b>	<b>\$44,746.80</b>	<b>\$30,528.96</b>
Total Points for Evaluation of Proposal (100 possible points)	100	85	93	66	95	60

Company	Aetna*	BCBS-TN	Cigna*	MetLife Fully Insured Quote Based on 602 Employees	MetLife*
Base Admin. Fee	\$3.41	\$3.30	\$3.40		
COBRA Admin. Fee					
HIPAA Admin. Fee					
Dental PPO Admin./Coordination Fee					
Dental PPO Access Fee	\$0.25				
Run-in PEPM		\$0.83			
Other Monthly Fees				Employee Only 222 x \$25.09	\$5,569.98
Total Monthly Fees	\$3.66	\$4.13	\$3.40	Employee+Family 380 x \$76.94	\$29,237.20
Run-in Fee Group					\$34,807.18
Annual Fees (if applicable)					x12
One-Time Set-Up Fees (if applicable)				Annual total	\$417,686.16
<b>TOTAL ANNUAL FEES</b>	<b>\$27,054.72</b>	<b>\$30,528.96</b>	<b>\$25,132.80</b>		
Total Points for Evaluation of Proposal (100 possible points)	83	85	83		70

Company	BAS*	Reliance Std.	Consociate*
Base Admin. Fee	\$3.00	\$3.69	\$3.00
COBRA Admin. Fee			
HIPAA Admin. Fee			
Dental PPO Admin./Coordination Fee			
Dental PPO Access Fee	\$2.50	\$0.24	
Other Monthly Fees			
Total Monthly Fees	\$5.50	\$3.93	\$3.00
Annual Fees (if applicable)			
Run-in Fee			
One-Time Set-Up Fees (if applicable)			
<b>TOTAL ANNUAL FEES</b>	<b>\$40,656.00</b>	<b>\$29,050.56</b>	<b>\$22,176.00</b>
Total Points for Evaluation of Proposal (100 possible points)	84	63	66

\*Notes:

1. Consociate does not include all fees
2. NAA did not include a network option.
3. Cigna does not provide run-in
4. Aetna provides COBRA on a per notice basis of \$.55 per notice
5. BAS - COBRA, HIPAA, PPO Admin., & Run-in fees included
6. MetLife provided a fully-insured quote only \$417,686 annual premium
7. Advantica -COBRA, HIPAA, PPO Admin., & Run-in fees included
8. MedBen fee includes \$1,232 for run-in fee & \$1,750 for one time set-up fee